

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF IDAHO

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY,  
WESTERN WATERSHEDS PROJECT,  
FRIENDS OF THE CLEARWATER, and  
WILDEARTH GUARDIANS,

Plaintiffs,

v.

C.L. "BUTCH" OTTER, Governor of Idaho, in  
his official capacity; VIRGIL MOORE,  
Director of the Idaho Department of Fish and  
Game, in his official capacity; BRAD  
CORKILL, FRED TREVEY, BOB  
BAROWSKY, MARK DOERR, RANDY  
BUDGE, KENNY ANDERSON, and WILL  
NAILLON, members of the Idaho Fish and  
Game Commission, in their official capacities,

Defendants.

Case No. 1:14-CV-258-BLW

**CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER**

**(Legal Track)**

In accordance with the agreements reached in the Telephone Scheduling  
Conference on September 4, 2014, and to further the efficient administration of this  
matter,

NOW THEREFORE IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, that the following recitation of  
deadlines and procedures shall govern this litigation:

1. Dispositive Motion Deadline: All dispositive motions shall be filed on **June 12, 2015**. This deadline will **not** be extended even if you are having discovery disputes.
  - a. This is the critical event for case management and will dictate when the trial will be set.
  - b. As provided below, a trial setting conference will be scheduled immediately following resolution of all dispositive motions. To facilitate a prompt trial setting, I will make every effort to schedule oral argument within 60 days and issue a decision within 30 days after the oral argument. If a decision is not issued within this time frame, I invite inquiry from counsel as to the status of the decision.
2. Amendment of Pleadings and Joinder of Parties: All motions to amend pleadings and join parties, except for allegations of punitive damages, shall be filed on or before **October 6, 2014**. This deadline shall only be extended for good cause shown.<sup>1</sup> All parties are entitled to know the claims and parties well-before trial rather than be forced to pursue or defend against a moving target. Although this deadline precedes the general discovery deadline, the parties are directed to send out all discovery requests that might relate to amendment or joinder enough in

---

<sup>1</sup> The Ninth Circuit has held that motions to amend filed after the Scheduling Order deadline are governed, not by the liberal provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a), but instead, by the more restrictive provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 16(b) requiring a showing of “good cause.” *Johnson v. Mammoth Recreations, Inc.*, 975 F.2d 604 (9th Cir. 1992).

advance of this amendment and joinder deadline to obtain the responses needed to make an informed decision on amendment and joinder.

3. Alternative Dispute Resolution Plan: The parties shall file their ADR plan on or before **December 3, 2014**. They may contact the Court's ADR Coordinator Susie Headlee at (208) 334-9067.
4. Discovery Plan: On or before **October 1, 2014**, the parties will exchange Rule 26(a)(1) initial disclosures. The parties propose no changes to the timing, form, or requirements of Rule 26(a). The parties anticipate discovery on the following subjects: 1) the occurrence of past lynx trapping and/or snaring in Idaho, 2) the likelihood of future lynx trapping and/or snaring in Idaho, and 3) the bases for Plaintiffs' standing and claims of injury. The parties intend to complete discovery in this case by 5/13/15, as indicated below.
  - a. At this time, the parties anticipate no issues with the disclosure or discovery of electronically stored information.
  - b. At this time, neither party intends to assert any claim of privilege (other than the attorney-client or work product privileges) over any document to be disclosed or produced through discovery. Should discovery involve sensitive biological or personal data, the parties will attempt to reach agreement regarding protection of such data.
  - c. The parties propose no changes to the presumptive limitations on written discovery set forth in Rules 33, 34, and 36. The parties propose to limit

themselves to 10 depositions each, with each such deposition not to exceed a 5-hour period over the course of 1 day.

- d. At this time, the parties request only the entry of a scheduling order pursuant to Rule 16(b)(1). To the extent the deadlines set forth in this Litigation Plan meet the Court's approval, the parties respectfully request that those dates be incorporated therein.
5. Completion of Discovery: All discovery will be completed by **May 13, 2015**. This is a deadline for the completion of all discovery; it is not a deadline for discovery requests. Discovery requests must be made far enough in advance of this deadline to allow completion of the discovery by the deadline date. The parties may, by stipulation, agree to defer some trial-related discovery, such as discovery related to damages issue, until after I have ruled on any dispositive issues.
6. Disclosure of Experts:
  - a. The Plaintiff shall disclose the experts intended to be called at trial on or before **March 13, 2015**.
  - b. The Defendant shall disclose the experts intended to be called at trial on or before **April 13, 2015**.
  - c. All rebuttal experts shall be identified on or before **April 27, 2015**.
7. Rules Governing Disclosure of Expert Witnesses: Within the deadlines for the disclosure of expert witnesses set out above, the parties shall also provide – for each expert disclosed – the report described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(B), as

modified by Local Rule 26.2(b). Supplementation to the expert witness report shall be done in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e)(1). Pursuant to Local Rule 26.2(b), expert witnesses will not be allowed to offer any opinion not disclosed in the mandatory Rule 26 disclosures, supplementation, or deposition. This includes rebuttal experts. No undisclosed expert rebuttal opinion testimony will be allowed at trial.

8. Scheduling of Trial and Pretrial Conference. Plaintiff's counsel shall contact In-Court Deputy Jamie Gearhart within one week following the entry of a decision on all pending dispositive motion to make arrangements for a telephone scheduling conference between counsel and me in which the trial and pretrial conference shall be set. If no dispositive motion is filed, Plaintiff's counsel shall immediately contact Ms. Gearhart within one week of the dispositive motion filing deadline to set a telephone scheduling conference.
9. Law Clerk: If counsel has a procedural or legal question that needs to be brought to my attention, please contact David Metcalf, the law clerk assigned to this case at (208) 334-9025 or dave\_metcalf@id.uscourts.gov.
10. Handling of Discovery Disputes and Non-disposition Motion:
  - a. I will **not** refer this case to a magistrate judge for resolution of discovery disputes and non-dispositive motions. I will keep these motions on my own docket.
  - b. The parties will strictly comply with the meet and confer requirements of Local Rule 37.1 prior to filing any discovery motions.

- c. In addition, I will not entertain any written discovery motions until the Court has been provided with an opportunity to informally mediate the parties' dispute. To facilitate that mediation, the attorneys will first contact David Metcalf, the law clerk assigned to this case, and shall provide him with a brief written summary of the dispute and the parties' respective positions. Mr. Metcalf may be able to offer suggestions that will resolve the dispute without the need of my involvement. If necessary, an off-the-record telephonic conference with me will then be scheduled as soon as possible. I will seek to resolve the dispute during that conference and may enter appropriate orders on the basis of the conference. I will only authorize the filing of a discovery motion and written briefing if we are unable to resolve the dispute during the conference.
  - d. Prior to filing any discovery motions, counsel must certify, not only that they have complied with Local Rule 37.1, but that they have complied with the foregoing procedures.
- 11. Calendaring Clerk: With regard to any scheduling matters or calendar issues, please contact my deputy clerk, Jamie Gearhart at (208) 334-9021.
  - 12. Docketing Clerk: If you have any docketing questions, please contact docketing at (208) 334-1361.



DATED: September 4, 2014

*B. Lynn Winmill*

B. Lynn Winmill  
Chief Judge  
United States District Court