## S. 2278

To improve agency rulemaking, and for other purposes.

## IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

June 24, 2021

Mr. PORTMAN introduced the following bill; which was read twice and referred to the Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs

## A BILL

To improve agency rulemaking, and for other purposes.

1	Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
2	tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,
3	SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.
4	This Act may be cited as the "Regulatory Account-
5	ability Act''.
6	SEC. 2. DEFINITIONS.
7	Section 551 of title 5, United States Code, is amend-
8	ed—
9	(1) in paragraph (5), by striking "rule making"
10	and inserting "rulemaking";
11	(2) in paragraph (6), by striking "rule making"

and inserting "rulemaking";

1	(3) in paragraph (13), by striking "and" at the
2	$\mathrm{end};$
3	(4) in paragraph (14), by striking the period at
4	the end and inserting a semicolon; and
5	(5) by adding at the end the following:
6	"(15) 'guidance' means an agency statement of
7	general applicability that—
8	"(A) is not intended to have the force and
9	effect of law; and
10	"(B) sets forth a policy on a statutory,
11	regulatory, or technical issue or an interpreta-
12	tion of a statutory or regulatory issue;
13	"(16) 'high-impact rule' means any rule that
14	the Administrator determines is likely to cause an
15	annual effect on the economy of \$500,000,000 or
16	more, adjusted once every 5 years to reflect in-
17	creases in the Consumer Price Index for All Urban
18	Consumers, as published by the Bureau of Labor
19	Statistics of the Department of Labor;
20	"(17) 'major guidance' means guidance that the
21	Administrator finds is likely to lead to—
22	"(A) an annual effect on the economy of
23	\$100,000,000 or more, adjusted once every 5
24	years to reflect increases in the Consumer Price
25	Index for All Urban Consumers, as published

1	by the Bureau of Labor Statistics of the De-
2	partment of Labor;
3	"(B) a major increase in costs or prices for
4	consumers, individual industries, Federal,
5	State, local, or Tribal government agencies, or
6	geographic regions; or
7	"(C) significant adverse effects on competi-
8	tion, employment, investment, productivity, in-
9	novation, public health and safety, or the ability
10	of United States-based enterprises to compete
11	with foreign-based enterprises in domestic and
12	export markets;
13	"(18) 'major rule' means any rule that the Ad-
14	ministrator determines is likely to cause—
15	"(A) an annual effect on the economy of
16	\$100,000,000 or more, adjusted once every 5
17	years to reflect increases in the Consumer Price
18	Index for All Urban Consumers, as published
19	by the Bureau of Labor Statistics of the De-
20	partment of Labor;
21	"(B) a major increase in costs or prices for
22	consumers, individual industries, Federal,
23	State, local, or Tribal government agencies, or
24	geographic regions; or

1	"(C) significant adverse effects on competi-
2	tion, employment, investment, productivity, in-
3	novation, public health and safety, or the ability
4	of United States-based enterprises to compete
5	with foreign-based enterprises in domestic and
6	export markets;
7	"(19) 'Office of Information and Regulatory Af-
8	fairs' means the office established under section
9	3503 of title 44 and any successor to that office;
10	and
11	"(20) 'Administrator' means the Administrator
12	of the Office of Information and Regulatory Af-
13	fairs.".
14	SEC. 3. RULEMAKING.
15	Section 553 of title 5, United States Code, is amend-
16	ed—
17	(1) in the section heading, by striking "Rule
18	making" and inserting "Rulemaking";
19	(2) in subsection (a), by striking "(a) This sec-
20	tion applies" and inserting the following:
21	"(a) Applicability.—This section applies"; and
22	(3) by striking subsections (b) through (e) and
23	inserting the following:

1	"(b) Rulemaking Considerations.—In a rule-
2	making, an agency shall consider, in addition to other ap-
3	plicable considerations, the following:
4	"(1) The legal authority under which a rule
5	may be proposed, including whether rulemaking is
6	required by statute or is within the discretion of the
7	agency.
8	"(2) The nature and significance of the problem
9	the agency intends to address with a rule.
10	"(3) Whether existing Federal laws or rules
11	have created or contributed to the problem the agen-
12	cy may address with a rule and, if so, whether those
13	Federal laws or rules could be amended or rescinded
14	to address the problem in whole or in part.
15	"(4) A reasonable number of alternatives for or
16	to a new rule, with the consideration of 3 alter-
17	natives presumed to be reasonable, that—
18	"(A) meet the objectives of the statutory
19	provision on which the rulemaking relies, in-
20	cluding substantial alternatives or other re-
21	sponses identified by the agency or by inter-
22	ested persons; and
23	"(B) consider not only mandating par-
24	ticular conduct or manners of compliance, but
25	also—

1	"(i) specifying performance objectives;
2	"(ii) establishing economic incentives,
3	including marketable permits, to encourage
4	desired behavior;
5	"(iii) establishing disclosure require-
6	ments that will provide information upon
7	which choices can be made by the public;
8	or
9	"(iv) adopting other means of meeting
10	the objectives of the statutory provision on
11	which the rulemaking relies without man-
12	dating particular conduct or manners of
13	compliance.
14	"(5) For any major rule or high-impact rule,
15	unless prohibited by law, the potential costs and
16	benefits associated with potential alternative rules
17	and other responses considered under paragraph (4),
18	including quantitative and qualitative analyses of—
19	"(A) the direct costs and benefits;
20	"(B) the nature and degree of risks ad-
21	dressed by the rule and the countervailing risks
22	that might be posed by agency action; and
23	"(C) to the extent practicable, the cumu-
24	lative costs and benefits, and an analysis of the
25	effects that the rule is anticipated to have on

1	entities that purchase products or services
2	from, sell products or services to, or otherwise
3	conduct business with entities to which the rule
4	will apply.
5	"(c) Notice of Proposed Rulemaking.—
6	"(1) In General.—If an agency determines
7	that the objectives of the agency require the agency
8	to issue a rule, the agency shall—
9	"(A) submit a notice of proposed rule-
10	making to the Administrator for review;
11	"(B) refrain from publishing the notice
12	until the Administrator determines that review
13	by the Administrator has concluded; and
14	"(C) at the conclusion of review by the Ad-
15	ministrator, publish a notice of proposed rule-
16	making in the Federal Register, which shall in-
17	clude—
18	"(i) a statement of the time, place,
19	and nature of any public rulemaking pro-
20	ceedings;
21	"(ii) a reference to the legal authority
22	under which the rule is proposed, including
23	the specific statutory provision on which
24	the rulemaking relies;
25	"(iii) the text of the proposed rule;

1	"(iv) a summary of information
2	known to the agency concerning the con-
3	siderations described in subsection (b); and
4	"(v) where otherwise consistent with
5	applicable law, for any major rule or high-
6	impact rule—
7	"(I) a reasoned preliminary ex-
8	planation regarding how—
9	"(aa) the proposed rule
10	meets the objectives of the statu-
11	tory provision on which the rule-
12	making relies; and
13	"(bb) the benefits of the
14	proposed rule justify the costs;
15	"(II) a discussion of—
16	"(aa) the costs and benefits
17	of alternatives considered by the
18	agency under subsection (b)(4);
19	"(bb) whether the alter-
20	natives considered by the agency
21	under subsection (b)(4) meet the
22	objectives of the statutory provi-
23	sion on which the rulemaking re-
24	lies; and

"(cc) the reasons why the 1 2 agency did not propose an alter-3 native considered by the agency 4 under subsection (b)(4); and "(III) a solicitation of public 6 comment, including on all issues and 7 alternatives discussed under sub-8 clauses (I) and (II) and subsection 9 (1)(1)(A).10 "(2) Accessibility.— "(A) IN GENERAL.—Not later than the 11 12 date on which an agency publishes a notice of 13 proposed rulemaking under paragraph (1), all 14 studies, models, scientific literature, and other 15 information developed or relied upon by the 16 agency, and actions taken by the agency to ob-17 tain that information, in connection with the

made accessible to the public.

"(B) Information controlled by nonGOVERNMENTAL PERSON.—With respect to any
information to which a nongovernmental person

determination of the agency to propose the rule

that is the subject of the rulemaking shall be

placed in the docket for the proposed rule and

18

19

20

21

22

23

1	tion, distribution, or public display, the infor-
2	mation shall be—
3	"(i) placed in the docket through cita-
4	tion or incorporation by reference, includ-
5	ing a specification of the identity of the
6	nongovernmental person who holds a legal
7	right to prohibit or limit reproduction, dis-
8	tribution, or public display of the informa-
9	tion and the means by which a member of
10	the public may request a full copy of the
11	information from that holder; and
12	"(ii) considered made accessible to the
13	public after a placement described in
14	clause (i), provided that the nongovern-
15	mental person who holds a legal right to
16	prohibit or limit reproduction, distribution,
17	or public display of the information makes
18	the information reasonably available upon
19	request in a timely manner to any member
20	of the public who requests a copy of the in-
21	formation.
22	"(C) Exception.—Subparagraphs (A)
23	and (B) shall not apply with respect to informa-
24	tion that is exempt from disclosure under sec-
25	tion 552(b).

1	"(3) Information quality.—If an agency
2	proposes a rule that rests upon scientific, technical,
3	or economic information, the agency shall—
4	"(A) propose the rule on the basis of the
5	best reasonably available scientific, technical, or
6	economic information; and
7	"(B) to the maximum extent practicable,
8	use that information in compliance with the
9	guidelines issued under section 515 of the
10	Treasury and General Government Appropria-
11	tions Act, 2001 (Public Law 106–554; 114
12	Stat. 2763A–154).
13	"(4) Public comment.—
14	"(A) IN GENERAL.—After publishing a no-
15	tice of proposed rulemaking under paragraph
16	(1), an agency shall provide interested persons
17	an opportunity to participate in the rulemaking
18	through the submission of written material,
19	data, views, or arguments with or without op-
20	portunity for oral presentation, except that—
21	"(i) if a public hearing is convened
22	under subsection (e), reasonable oppor-
23	tunity for oral presentation shall be pro-
24	vided at the public hearing as provided in
25	subsection (e); and

1	"(ii) when, other than as provided in
2	subsection (e), a rule is required by statute
3	to be made on the record after opportunity
4	for an agency hearing—
5	"(I) sections 556 and 557 shall
6	apply; and
7	"(II) the petition procedures of
8	subsection (e) shall not apply.
9	"(B) TIMELINE.—
10	"(i) In general.—Subject to sub-
11	paragraph (C), an agency shall provide not
12	less than 60 days, or, with respect to a
13	proposed major rule or a proposed high-im-
14	pact rule, not less than 90 days, for inter-
15	ested persons to submit written material,
16	data, views, or arguments under subpara-
17	graph (A).
18	"(ii) Adequate review period.—If
19	a proposed rule relies on information
20	placed in the docket through citation or in-
21	corporation by reference as described in
22	paragraph (3)(B), the comment period re-
23	quired under clause (i) shall be adequate
24	to allow interested persons to receive and

review that information to inform their submission.

"(C) Responsive comment period for Major and High-impact rule, an interested person who made a submission under subparagraph (A) during the comment period under subparagraph (B) with respect to the rule may, during the period beginning on the day after the date on which that comment period closes and ending on the date that is 30 days after that day, respond to any other submission made by any other interested person under subparagraph (A) during the initial comment period.

- "(D) Accessibility.—All comments and responses submitted under this paragraph shall be promptly placed in the docket and made accessible to the public.
- "(5) CHANGE OF CLASSIFICATION AFTER PUB-LICATION OF NOTICE.—If, after an agency submits for review and publishes the notice of proposed rulemaking required under paragraph (1), a proposed rule is determined to be a major rule or a high-impact rule, the agency shall—

1	"(A) publish a notice in the Federal Reg-
2	ister with respect to the change of the classi-
3	fication of the rule; and
4	"(B) allow interested persons an additional
5	opportunity of not less than 30 days to com-
6	ment on—
7	"(i) the rule; and
8	"(ii) the change of the classification of
9	the rule.
10	"(6) Prohibition on Certain Communica-
11	TIONS.—
12	"(A) IN GENERAL.—Except as provided in
13	subparagraph (B), after an agency publishes a
14	notice of proposed rulemaking required under
15	paragraph (1), or after an agency publishes a
16	notice of initiation of rulemaking under sub-
17	section (d)(1)(B), the agency, and any indi-
18	vidual acting in an official capacity on behalf of
19	the agency, may not communicate, and a person
20	who receives Federal funds from the agency
21	may not use those funds to communicate,
22	through written, oral, electronic, or other
23	means, to the public with respect to the pro-
24	posed rule in a manner that—

1	"(i) directly advocates, in support of
2	or against the proposed rule, for the sub-
3	mission of information that will form part
4	of the record for the proposed rule;
5	"(ii) appeals to the public, or solicits
6	a third party, to undertake advocacy in
7	support of or against the proposed rule; or
8	"(iii) is directly or indirectly for the
9	purpose of publicity or propaganda within
10	the United States in a manner that Con-
11	gress has not authorized.
12	"(B) Exception.—The prohibition under
13	subparagraph (A) shall not apply to a commu-
14	nication that requests comments on, or provides
15	information regarding, a proposed rule in an
16	impartial manner.
17	"(d) Initiation of Rulemaking for Major and
18	HIGH-IMPACT RULES.—
19	"(1) Notice for major and high-impact
20	RULES.—When an agency determines to initiate a
21	rulemaking that may result in a major rule or a
22	high-impact rule, the agency shall—
23	"(A) establish an electronic docket for that
24	rulemaking, which may have a physical counter-
25	part; and

1	"(B) publish a notice of initiation of rule-
2	making in the Federal Register, which shall—
3	"(i) briefly describe the subject and
4	objectives of, and the problem to be solved
5	by, the rule;
6	"(ii) refer to the legal authority under
7	which the rule would be proposed, includ-
8	ing the specific statutory provision that au-
9	thorizes the rulemaking;
10	"(iii) invite interested persons to pro-
11	pose alternatives and other ideas regarding
12	how best to accomplish the objectives of
13	the agency in the most effective manner;
14	"(iv) indicate how interested persons
15	may submit written material for the dock-
16	et; and
17	"(v) appear in the Federal Register
18	not later than 90 days before the date on
19	which the agency publishes a notice of pro-
20	posed rulemaking for the rule.
21	"(2) Accessibility.—All information provided
22	to the agency under paragraph (1) shall be promptly
23	placed in the docket and made accessible to the pub-
24	lic, unless the information—

1	"(A) is information to which the submitter
2	does not hold a legal right to authorize disclo-
3	sure; or
4	"(B) is exempt from disclosure under sec-
5	tion 552(b).
6	"(3) APPLICABILITY.—With respect to the al-
7	ternatives and other ideas proposed under paragraph
8	(1)(B)(iii)—
9	"(A) the alternatives and other ideas are
10	for the benefit of—
11	"(i) the agency receiving the alter-
12	natives and other ideas; and
13	"(ii) the public; and
14	"(B) the agency receiving the alternatives
15	and other ideas may respond to the alternatives
16	and other ideas.
17	"(4) Timetable.—
18	"(A) IN GENERAL.—After considering any
19	written material submitted by interested per-
20	sons under paragraph (1), if an agency deter-
21	mines to proceed with a rulemaking for a major
22	rule or a high-impact rule, the agency proposing
23	the rule shall establish a timetable for the rule-
24	making that—

1	"(i) contains intermediate completion
2	dates for actions of the agency, includ-
3	ing—
4	"(I) the anticipated date on
5	which the agency shall publish the no-
6	tice required under subsection $(c)(1)$
7	with respect to the rule; and
8	"(II) the duration of the com-
9	ment period required under subsection
10	(c)(4), including the date on which the
11	comment period shall end; and
12	"(ii) includes a final completion date
13	for actions by the agency.
14	"(B) Publication.—The timetable re-
15	quired under subparagraph (A) shall be pub-
16	lished in the electronic docket established under
17	paragraph (1)(A) with respect to the rule-
18	making.
19	"(C) Consideration of factors.—In
20	establishing the timetable required under sub-
21	paragraph (A), an agency shall consider rel-
22	evant factors, including—
23	"(i) the size and complexity of the
24	rulemaking;

1	"(ii) the resources available to the
2	agency;
3	"(iii) the national significance of the
4	rulemaking; and
5	"(iv) all statutory requirements that
6	govern the timing of the rulemaking.
7	"(D) Report required.—
8	"(i) In General.—An agency that
9	fails to meet an intermediate or final com-
10	pletion date for an action established under
11	subparagraph (A) shall submit to Congress
12	and the Director of the Office of Manage-
13	ment and Budget a report regarding why
14	the agency failed to meet the completion
15	date.
16	"(ii) Contents; publication in
17	FEDERAL REGISTER.—A report submitted
18	under clause (i) shall—
19	"(I) include an amended time-
20	table for the rulemaking; and
21	"(II) be published—
22	"(aa) in the Federal Reg-
23	ister; and
24	"(bb) in the electronic dock-
25	et established under paragraph

1	(1)(A) with respect to the rule-
2	making.
3	"(E) Changes to intermediate dates
4	PUBLISHED IN ELECTRONIC DOCKET.—If an
5	agency changes an intermediate completion date
6	for an action of the agency established under
7	subparagraph (A)(i), the agency shall publish in
8	the electronic docket established under para-
9	graph (1)(A)—
10	"(i) the updated completion date for
11	the action; and
12	"(ii) a brief explanation regarding the
13	reason for the change to the completion
14	date.
15	"(5) Notice of Determination of other
16	AGENCY COURSE.—
17	"(A) In General.—If, after publishing
18	the notice required under paragraph (1), an
19	agency determines not to issue a major rule or
20	a high-impact rule, the agency shall—
21	"(i) publish a notice of determination
22	of other agency course; and
23	"(ii) if the agency intends to issue a
24	rule, comply with the procedures required
25	under subsection (c).

1	"(B) Contents.—A notice of determina-
2	tion of other agency course published under
3	subparagraph (A)(i) shall include—
4	"(i) a description of the alternative re-
5	sponse the agency has determined to
6	adopt; and
7	"(ii) if the agency intends to issue a
8	rule, any information required under sub-
9	section (c).
10	"(e) Public Hearing for High-Impact Rules.—
11	"(1) Petition for public hearing.—
12	"(A) IN GENERAL.—Before the date on
13	which the comment period closes with respect to
14	a proposed high-impact rule, an interested per-
15	son may petition the agency that proposed the
16	rule to hold a public hearing in accordance with
17	this subsection.
18	"(B) Granting and denial of peti-
19	TION.—
20	"(i) Granting of Petition.—Not
21	later than 30 days after the date on which
22	an agency receives a petition submitted
23	under subparagraph (A) with respect to a
24	rule, the agency shall grant the petition, in

1	whole or in part, if the petition shows
2	that—
3	"(I) the proposed rule is based
4	on conclusions with respect to 1 or
5	more specific scientific, technical, eco-
6	nomic, or other complex factual issues
7	that are genuinely disputed;
8	"(II) with respect to a rule that
9	the agency is required to reissue not
10	less frequently than once every 3
11	years, the interested person submit-
12	ting the petition could not have raised
13	the disputed factual issues described
14	in subclause (I) during the 5-year pe-
15	riod preceding the date on which the
16	petition is submitted; and
17	"(III) the resolution of the dis-
18	puted factual issues described in sub-
19	clause (I) would likely have an effect
20	on—
21	"(aa) the costs and benefits
22	of the proposed rule; or
23	"(bb) whether the proposed
24	rule achieves relevant statutory
25	objectives, including the objec-

1	tives of the statutory provision on
2	which the rulemaking relies.
3	"(ii) Denial of Petition.—If an
4	agency denies a petition submitted under
5	subparagraph (A) in whole or in part, the
6	agency shall include in the rulemaking
7	record an explanation for the denial that is
8	sufficient for judicial review, including—
9	"(I) findings by the agency
10	that—
11	"(aa) there is no genuine
12	dispute as to the factual issues
13	raised by the petition; or
14	"(bb) with respect to a rule
15	that the agency is required to re-
16	issue not less frequently than
17	once every 3 years, the interested
18	person submitting the petition
19	could have raised the disputed
20	factual issues in the petition dur-
21	ing the 5-year period preceding
22	the date on which the petition is
23	submitted; and
24	"(II) a reasoned determination
25	by the agency that the factual issues

1	raised by the petition, even if subject
2	to genuine dispute and not subject to
3	subclause (I)(bb), will not have an ef-
4	fect on—
5	"(aa) the costs and benefits
6	of the proposed rule; or
7	"(bb) whether the proposed
8	rule achieves relevant statutory
9	objectives, including the objec-
10	tives of the statutory provision on
11	which the rulemaking relies.
12	"(iii) Inclusion in the record.—A
13	petition submitted under subparagraph (A)
14	with respect to a high-impact rule and the
15	decision of an agency with respect to the
16	petition shall be included in the rulemaking
17	record.
18	"(2) Notice of Hearing.—Not later than 45
19	days before the date on which a hearing is held
20	under this subsection, an agency shall publish in the
21	Federal Register a notice specifying—
22	"(A) the proposed rule to be considered at
23	the hearing; and
24	"(B) the factual issues to be considered at
25	the hearing.

1	"(3) Hearing requirements.—
2	"(A) LIMITED NATURE OF HEARING.—A
3	hearing held under this subsection shall be lim-
4	ited to—
5	"(i) the specific factual issues raised
6	in a petition granted in whole or in part
7	under paragraph (1); and
8	"(ii) any other factual issues the reso-
9	lution of which an agency, in the discretion
10	of the agency, determines will advance con-
11	sideration by the agency of the proposed
12	rule.
13	"(B) Procedures.—
14	"(i) Burden of Proof.—Except as
15	otherwise provided by statute, a proponent
16	of a rule has the burden of proof in a hear-
17	ing held under this subsection.
18	"(ii) Admission of evidence.—In a
19	hearing held under this subsection, any
20	documentary or oral evidence may be re-
21	ceived, except that an agency, as a matter
22	of policy, shall provide for the exclusion of
23	immaterial or unduly repetitious evidence.
24	"(iii) Adoption of Rules Gov-
25	ERNING HEARINGS.—To govern a hearing

1	held under this subsection, each agency
2	shall adopt rules that provide for—
3	"(I) the appointment of an agen-
4	cy official or administrative law judge
5	to preside at the hearing;
6	"(II) the presentation by inter-
7	ested parties of relevant documentary
8	or oral evidence, unless the evidence is
9	immaterial or unduly repetitious;
10	"(III) a reasonable and adequate
11	opportunity for cross-examination by
12	interested parties concerning genu-
13	inely disputed factual issues raised by
14	the petition, provided that, in the case
15	of multiple interested parties with the
16	same or similar interests, the agency
17	may require the use of common coun-
18	sel where the common counsel may
19	adequately represent the interests that
20	will be significantly affected by the
21	proposed rule; and
22	"(IV) when appropriate, and to
23	the extent practicable, the consolida-
24	tion of proceedings with respect to

1	multiple petitions submitted under
2	this subsection into a single hearing.
3	"(C) Record of Hearing.—A transcript
4	of testimony and exhibits, together with all pa-
5	pers and requests filed in the hearing, shall
6	constitute the exclusive record for decision of
7	the factual issues addressed in a hearing held
8	under this subsection.
9	"(4) Judicial review.—
10	"(A) In general.—Failure to petition for
11	a hearing under this subsection shall not pre-
12	clude judicial review of any claim that could
13	have been raised in the hearing petition or at
14	the hearing.
15	"(B) TIMING OF JUDICIAL REVIEW.—
16	There shall be no judicial review of the disposi-
17	tion of a petition by an agency under this sub-
18	section until judicial review of the final action
19	of the agency.
20	"(f) Final Rules.—
21	"(1) Net benefits of major or high-im-
22	PACT RULE.—
23	"(A) In general.—Except as provided in
24	subparagraph (B), in a rulemaking for a major
25	rule or a high-impact rule, an agency shall

1	adopt the alternative considered under sub-
2	section (b)(5) that maximizes net benefits, tak-
3	ing into consideration only the costs and bene-
4	fits that arise within the scope of the statutory
5	provision that authorizes the rulemaking.
6	"(B) Exceptions.—In a rulemaking for a
7	major rule or a high-impact rule, an agency
8	may adopt an alternative other than as required
9	under subparagraph (A) only if—
10	"(i) the Administrator approves the
11	adoption by the agency of the alternative;
12	and
13	"(ii) the alternative is adopted to—
14	"(I) account for costs or benefits
15	that cannot be quantified, including
16	costs or benefits related to constitu-
17	tional or civil rights, provided that the
18	agency identifies all such costs and
19	benefits and explains why those costs
20	and benefits justify the adoption of
21	the alternative; or
22	"(II) achieve additional benefits
23	or cost reductions, provided that the
24	agency—
25	"(aa) identifies—

1	"(AA) all such addi-
2	tional benefits and the asso-
3	ciated costs of those bene-
4	fits; and
5	"(BB) all such cost re-
6	ductions and the associated
7	benefits of those cost reduc-
8	tions; and
9	"(bb) explains why—
10	"(AA) the additional
11	benefits justify the addi-
12	tional costs; or
13	"(BB) the additional
14	cost reductions justify any
15	benefits foregone.
16	"(C) Rule of Construction.—Nothing
17	in subparagraph (A) may be construed to pre-
18	clude an agency from including in an alter-
19	native adopted pursuant to such subparagraph
20	changes made as a result of agency analysis or
21	review performed under chapter 6 of this title.
22	"(2) Publication of notice of final rule-
23	MAKING.—After submitting a final rule to the Ad-
24	ministrator for review and obtaining a certification
25	from the Administrator that the review has con-

1	cluded, the agency shall publish a notice of final
2	rulemaking in the Federal Register, which shall in-
3	clude—
4	"(A) a concise, general statement of the
5	basis and purpose of the rule and a reference
6	to the legal authority under which the rule is
7	made, including the specific statutory provision
8	on which the rulemaking relies;
9	"(B) a reasoned determination by the
10	agency regarding the considerations described
11	in subsection (b);
12	"(C) a response to each significant issue
13	raised in the comments on the proposed rule;
14	and
15	"(D) with respect to a major rule or a
16	high-impact rule, a reasoned determination by
17	the agency that—
18	"(i) the benefits of the rule advance
19	the relevant objectives of the statutory pro-
20	vision on which the rulemaking relies and
21	justify the costs of the rule; and
22	"(ii)(I) no other alternative considered
23	would achieve the relevant objectives of the
24	statutory provision on which the rule-
25	making relies in a manner that more

1	greatly maximizes net benefits as required
2	under paragraph (1)(A); or
3	"(II) the adoption by the agency of a
4	more costly or less costly rule complies
5	with paragraph (1)(B).
6	"(3) Information quality.—If an agency
7	rulemaking rests upon scientific, technical, or eco-
8	nomic information, the agency shall—
9	"(A) adopt a final rule on the basis of the
10	best reasonably available scientific, technical, or
11	economic information; and
12	"(B) to the maximum extent practicable,
13	use that information in compliance with the
14	guidelines issued under section 515 of the
15	Treasury and General Government Appropria-
16	tions Act, 2001 (Public Law 106–554; 114
17	Stat. 2763A–154).
18	"(4) Accessibility.—
19	"(A) IN GENERAL.—Not later than the
20	date on which an agency publishes a notice of
21	final rulemaking under paragraph (2), all stud-
22	ies, models, scientific literature, and other in-
23	formation developed or relied upon by the agen-
24	cy, and actions taken by the agency to obtain
25	that information in connection with the deter-

mination of the agency to finalize the rule that is the subject of the rulemaking shall be placed in the docket for the rule and made accessible to the public.

"(B) Information controlled by non-Governmental person.—With respect to any information to which a nongovernmental person holds a legal right to prohibit or limit reproduction, distribution, or public display, the information shall be—

"(i) placed in the docket through citation or incorporation by reference, including a specification of the identity of the nongovernmental person who holds a legal right to prohibit or limit reproduction, distribution, or public display of the information and the means by which a member of the public may request a full copy of the information from that holder; and

"(ii) considered made accessible to the public after a placement described in clause (i), provided that the nongovernmental person who holds a legal right to prohibit or limit reproduction, distribution, or public display of the information makes

1	the information reasonably available upon
2	request in a timely manner.
3	"(C) Exception.—Subparagraphs (A)
4	and (B) shall not apply with respect to informa-
5	tion that is exempt from disclosure under sec-
6	tion 552(b).
7	"(5) Rules adopted at the end of a presi-
8	DENTIAL ADMINISTRATION.—
9	"(A) In general.—During the 60-day pe-
10	riod beginning on a transitional inauguration
11	day (as defined in section 3349a), with respect
12	to any final rule that had been placed on file
13	for public inspection by the Office of the Fed-
14	eral Register or published in the Federal Reg-
15	ister as of the date of the inauguration, but
16	which had not become effective by the date of
17	the inauguration, the agency issuing the rule
18	may, by order, delay the effective date of the
19	rule for not more than 90 days for the purpose
20	of obtaining public comment on whether—
21	"(i) the rule should be amended or re-
22	scinded; or
23	"(ii) the effective date of the rule
24	should be further delayed.

1 "(B) Opportunity for comment.—If an
2 agency delays the effective date of a rule under
3 subparagraph (A), the agency shall give the
4 public not less than 30 days to submit comments.
5 ments.
6 "(g) Applicability.—

"(1) Primacy of Certain Rulemaking considerations and procedures in other federal laws.—

"(A) Considerations.—If a rulemaking is authorized under a Federal law that requires an agency to consider, or prohibits an agency from considering, a factor in a manner that is inconsistent with, or that conflicts with, the requirements under this section, for the purposes of this section, the requirement or prohibition, as applicable, in that other Federal law shall apply to the agency in the rulemaking.

"(B) PROCEDURAL REQUIREMENTS.—If a rulemaking is authorized under a Federal law that requires an agency to follow or use, or prohibits an agency from following or using, a procedure in a manner that is duplicative of, or that conflicts with, a procedural requirement under this section, for the purposes of this sec-

1	tion, the requirement or prohibition, as applica-
2	ble, in that other Federal law shall apply to the
3	agency in the rulemaking.
4	"(2) Guidance and Rules of Organiza-
5	TION.—Except as otherwise provided by law, this
6	section shall not apply to guidance or rules of agen-
7	cy organization, procedure, or practice.
8	"(3) Exceptions for good cause.—
9	"(A) FINDING OF GOOD CAUSE.—
10	"(i) In General.—If an agency for
11	good cause finds that compliance with sub-
12	section (c), (d), (e), or $(f)(2)(B)$ before
13	issuing a final rule is unnecessary, imprac-
14	ticable, or contrary to the public interest,
15	that subsection shall not apply and the
16	agency may issue the final rule or an in-
17	terim final rule, as applicable, under sub-
18	paragraph (B) or (C).
19	"(ii) Incorporation of good cause
20	FINDING.—If an agency makes a finding
21	under clause (i), the agency shall include
22	that finding and a brief statement with re-
23	spect to the reasons for that finding in the
24	final rule or interim final rule, as applica-
25	ble, issued by the agency.

1	"(B) DIRECT FINAL RULES.—
2	"(i) In general.—Except as pro-
3	vided in clause (ii), if an agency makes a
4	finding under subparagraph (A)(i) that
5	compliance with subsection (e), (d), (e), or
6	(f)(2)(B) before issuing a final rule is un-
7	necessary, the agency shall, before issuing
8	the final rule—
9	"(I) publish in the Federal Reg-
10	ister the text of the final rule, the
11	brief statement required under sub-
12	paragraph (A)(ii), and a notice of op-
13	portunity for public comment;
14	"(II) establish a comment period
15	of not less than 30 days for any inter-
16	ested person to submit written mate-
17	rial, data, views, or arguments with
18	respect to the final rule; and
19	"(III) provide notice of the date
20	on which the rule will take effect.
21	"(ii) Exception.—An agency that
22	made a finding described in clause (i) may
23	choose not to follow the requirements
24	under that clause if the agency determines

1	that following the requirements would not
2	expedite the issuance of the final rule.
3	"(iii) Adverse comments.—If an
4	agency receives significant adverse com-
5	ments with respect to a rule during the
6	comment period established under clause
7	(i)(II), the agency shall—
8	"(I) withdraw the notice of final
9	rulemaking published by the agency
10	with respect to the rule; and
11	"(II) complete rulemaking in ac-
12	cordance with subsections (c) through
13	(f), as applicable.
14	"(C) Interim final rules.—
15	"(i) In General.—If an agency for
16	good cause finds that compliance with sub-
17	section (c), (d), (e), or $(f)(2)(B)$ before
18	issuing a final rule is impracticable or con-
19	trary to the public interest, the agency
20	shall issue an interim final rule by—
21	"(I) publishing the interim final
22	rule and a request for public comment
23	in the portion of the Federal Register
24	relating to final rules; and

1	"(II) providing a cross-reference
2	in the portion of the Federal Register
3	relating to proposed rules that re-
4	quests public comment with respect to
5	the rule not later than 60 days after
6	the rule is published under subclause
7	(I).
8	"(ii) Interim period.—
9	"(I) IN GENERAL.—Not later
10	than 180 days after the date on which
11	an agency issues an interim final rule
12	under clause (i), the agency shall—
13	"(aa) rescind the interim
14	rule;
15	"(bb) initiate rulemaking in
16	accordance with subsections (c)
17	through (f); or
18	"(cc) take final action to
19	adopt a final rule.
20	"(II) No force or effect.—If
21	as of the end of the 180-day period
22	described in subclause (I), an agency
23	fails to take an action described in
24	item (aa), (bb), or (cc) of that sub-
25	clause, the interim final rule issued by

1	the agency shall have no force or ef-
2	fect.
3	"(4) Exemption for monetary policy.—
4	This section shall not apply to a rulemaking or to
5	guidance that concerns monetary policy proposed or
6	implemented by the Board of Governors of the Fed-
7	eral Reserve System or the Federal Open Market
8	Committee.
9	"(5) Rule of Construction.—Nothing in
10	this subsection shall be construed to modify, alter, or
11	abridge exclusive rights held pursuant to title 17.
12	"(h) Date of Publication.—A final rule, a direct
13	final rule described in subsection (g)(3)(B), or an interim
14	final rule described in subsection (g)(3)(C) shall be pub-
15	lished not later than 30 days (or, in the case of a major
16	rule or a high-impact rule, not later than 60 days) before
17	the effective date of the rule, except—
18	"(1) for guidance; or
19	"(2) as otherwise provided by an agency for
20	good cause and as published with the rule.
21	"(i) Right to Petition and Review of Rules.—
22	Each agency shall—
23	"(1) give interested persons the right to petition
24	for the issuance, amendment, or repeal of a rule;
25	and

1	"(2) on a continuing basis, invite interested
2	persons to submit, by electronic means, suggestions
3	for rules that warrant retrospective review and pos-
4	sible modification or repeal.
5	"(j) Rulemaking Guidelines.—
6	"(1) Assessment of Rules.—
7	"(A) In General.—The Administrator
8	shall establish guidelines regarding rulemaking
9	as follows:
10	"(i) Identification of need for
11	RULES.—Guidelines setting forth how
12	needs for rulemaking should be identified,
13	including—
14	"(I) whether rulemaking is made
15	necessary by compelling public need,
16	such as material failures of private
17	markets or public institutions to pro-
18	tect or improve the health and safety
19	of the public, the environment, or the
20	well-being of the public; and
21	"(II) whether rulemaking needs
22	could be lessened by reliance on po-
23	tential State, local, Tribal, or regional
24	regulatory action or other responses

1	that could be taken in lieu of agency
2	action.
3	"(ii) Assessment of Rules.—Guide-
4	lines setting forth how the assessment, in-
5	cluding the quantitative and qualitative as-
6	sessment, of proposed and final rules
7	should occur, including how to determine—
8	"(I) the costs and benefits of
9	proposed and final rules and alter-
10	natives to them, including quantifiable
11	and non-quantifiable costs and bene-
12	fits;
13	"(II) whether proposed and final
14	rules maximize net benefits;
15	"(III) estimated impacts on jobs,
16	wages, competition, innovation, and
17	low-income populations;
18	"(IV) other economic issues that
19	are relevant to rulemaking under this
20	section or other sections of this part;
21	and
22	"(V) risk assessments that are
23	relevant to rulemaking under this sec-
24	tion and other sections of this part.

1	"(iii) Numbers of alternatives.—
2	Guidelines regarding when it may be rea-
3	sonable to consider in a rulemaking more
4	alternatives than the number presumed to
5	be reasonable under subsection (b)(4).
6	"(iv) Adoption of alternatives
7	FOR MAJOR OR HIGH-IMPACT RULES.—
8	Guidelines regarding when it may be ap-
9	propriate, in a rulemaking for a major or
10	high-impact rule, to adopt an alternative
11	final rule under subsection $(f)(1)(B)$ .
12	"(v) Administrator review.—
13	Guidelines regarding the efficient submis-
14	sion and review of proposed and final rules
15	under subsections $(e)(1)$ and $(f)(2)$ .
16	"(B) AGENCY ANALYSIS OF RULES.—
17	"(i) In general.—The rigor of the
18	cost-benefit analysis required or rec-
19	ommended by the guidelines established
20	under subparagraph (A) shall be commen-
21	surate, as determined by the Adminis-
22	trator, with the economic impact of a rule.
23	"(ii) Risk assessment guide-
24	LINES —Guidelines for a risk assessment

1	described in subparagraph (A)(iv) shall in-
2	clude criteria for—
3	"(I) selecting studies and models;
4	"(II) evaluating and weighing
5	evidence; and
6	"(III) conducting peer reviews.
7	"(C) Updating guidelines.—Not less
8	frequently than once every 10 years, the Ad-
9	ministrator shall update the guidelines estab-
10	lished under subparagraph (A) to enable each
11	agency to use the best available techniques to
12	identify, quantify, and evaluate the need for
13	rulemaking and present and future benefits,
14	costs, other economic issues, and risks as objec-
15	tively and accurately as practicable.
16	"(2) Simplification of rules.—
17	"(A) Issuance of Guidelines.—The Ad-
18	ministrator shall issue guidelines to promote co-
19	ordination, simplification, and harmonization of
20	agency rules during the rulemaking process.
21	"(B) REQUIREMENTS.—The guidelines
22	issued by the Administrator under subpara-
23	graph (A) shall advise each agency to—
24	"(i) avoid rules that are inconsistent
25	or incompatible with, or duplicative of,

1	other regulations of the agency and those
2	of other agencies; and
3	"(ii) draft the rules of the agency to
4	be simple and easy to understand, with the
5	goal of minimizing the potential for uncer-
6	tainty and litigation arising from the un-
7	certainty.
8	"(3) Consistency in Rulemaking.—
9	"(A) In general.—To promote consist-
10	ency in rulemaking, the Administrator shall—
11	"(i) issue guidelines to ensure that
12	rulemaking conducted in whole or in part
13	under procedures specified in provisions of
14	law other than those under this section
15	conform with the procedures set forth in
16	this section to the fullest extent allowed by
17	law; and
18	"(ii) issue guidelines for the adoption
19	of rules under subsection (e)(3)(B)(iii),
20	which shall provide a reasonable oppor-
21	tunity for cross-examination, as described
22	in subsection (e)(3)(B)(iii)(III).
23	"(B) AGENCY ADOPTION OF REGULA-
24	TIONS.—Each agency shall adopt regulations

1	for the conduct of hearings consistent with the
2	guidelines issued under this paragraph.
3	"(k) Agency Guidance; Procedures To Issue
4	Major Guidance; Authority To Issue Guidelines
5	FOR ISSUANCE OF GUIDANCE.—
6	"(1) In general.—Agency guidance shall—
7	"(A) not be used by an agency to foreclose
8	consideration of issues as to which the guidance
9	expresses a conclusion;
10	"(B) state that the guidance is not legally
11	binding; and
12	"(C) at the time the guidance is issued, or
13	upon request, be made available by the issuing
14	agency to interested persons and the public.
15	"(2) Procedures to issue major guid-
16	ANCE.—Before issuing any major guidance, an agen-
17	cy shall make and document a reasoned determina-
18	tion that—
19	"(A) such guidance is understandable and
20	complies with relevant statutory objectives and
21	regulatory provisions; and
22	"(B) identifies the costs and benefits, in-
23	cluding all costs and benefits to be considered
24	during a rulemaking as required under sub-
25	section (b), of requiring conduct conforming to

1	such guidance and assures that such benefits
2	justify such costs.
3	"(3) Issuance of updated guidance.—
4	"(A) In General.—The Administrator
5	shall issue updated guidelines for use by agen-
6	cies in the issuance of guidance documents.
7	"(B) REQUIREMENTS.—The guidelines
8	issued by the Administrator under subpara-
9	graph (A) shall advise each agency—
10	"(i) not to issue guidance documents
11	that are inconsistent or incompatible with,
12	or duplicative of, other rules of the agency
13	and those of other agencies;
14	"(ii) to draft the guidance documents
15	of the agency to be simple and easy to un-
16	derstand, with the goal of minimizing the
17	potential for uncertainty and litigation
18	arising from the uncertainty; and
19	"(iii) how to develop and implement a
20	strategy to ensure the proper use of guid-
21	ance by the agency.
22	"(l) Major Rule and High-Impact Rule Frame-
23	WORKS.—
24	"(1) In general.—Beginning on the date that
25	is 180 days after the date of enactment of this sub-

1	section, when an agency publishes in the Federal
2	Register—
3	"(A) a proposed major rule or a proposed
4	high-impact rule, the agency shall include a po-
5	tential framework for assessing the rule, which
6	shall include a general statement of how the
7	agency intends to measure the effectiveness of
8	the rule; or
9	"(B) a final major rule or a final high-im-
10	pact rule, the agency shall include a framework
11	for assessing the rule under paragraph (2),
12	which shall include—
13	"(i) a clear statement of the regu-
14	latory objectives of the rule, including a
15	summary of the benefit and cost of the
16	rule;
17	"(ii) the methodology by which the
18	agency plans to analyze the rule, including
19	metrics by which the agency can meas-
20	ure—
21	"(I) the effectiveness and bene-
22	fits of the rule in producing the regu-
23	latory objectives of the rule; and

1	"(II) the impacts, including any
2	costs, of the rule on regulated and
3	other impacted entities;
4	"(iii) a plan for gathering data re-
5	garding the metrics described in clause (ii)
6	on an ongoing basis, or at periodic times
7	including a method by which the agency
8	will invite the public to participate in the
9	review process and seek input from other
10	agencies; and
11	"(iv) a specific timeframe, as appro-
12	priate to the rule and not more than 10
13	years after the effective date of the rule
14	under which the agency shall conduct the
15	assessment of the rule in accordance with
16	paragraph (2)(A).
17	"(2) Assessment.—
18	"(A) IN GENERAL.—Each agency shall as-
19	sess the data collected under paragraph
20	(1)(B)(iii), using the methodology set forth in
21	paragraph (1)(B)(ii) or any other appropriate
22	methodology developed after the issuance of a
23	final major rule or a final high-impact rule to
24	better determine whether the regulatory objec-

tive was achieved, with respect to the rule—

25

1	"(i) to analyze how the actual benefits
2	and costs of the rule may have varied from
3	those anticipated at the time the rule was
4	issued; and
5	"(ii) to determine whether—
6	"(I) the rule is accomplishing the
7	regulatory objective of the rule;
8	"(II) the rule has been rendered
9	unnecessary, taking into consider-
10	ation—
11	"(aa) changes in the subject
12	area affected by the rule; and
13	"(bb) whether the rule over-
14	laps, duplicates, or conflicts
15	with—
16	"(AA) other rules; or
17	"(BB) to the extent
18	feasible, State and local gov-
19	ernment regulations;
20	"(III) the rule needs to be modi-
21	fied in order to accomplish the regu-
22	latory objective; and
23	"(IV) other alternatives to the
24	rule or modification of the rule could
25	better achieve the regulatory objective

1	while imposing a smaller burden on
2	society or increase cost-effectiveness,
3	taking into consideration any cost al-
4	ready incurred.
5	"(B) DIFFERENT METHODOLOGY.—If an
6	agency uses a methodology other than the
7	methodology under paragraph (1)(B)(ii) to as-
8	sess data under subparagraph (A), the agency
9	shall include as part of the notice required to
10	be published under subparagraph (D) an expla-
11	nation of the changes in circumstances that ne-
12	cessitated the use of that other methodology.
13	"(C) Subsequent assessments.—
14	"(i) In general.—Except as pro-
15	vided in clause (ii), if, after an assessment
16	of a major rule or a high-impact rule
17	under subparagraph (A), an agency deter-
18	mines that the rule will remain in effect
19	with or without modification, the agency
20	shall—
21	"(I) determine a specific time, as
22	appropriate to the rule and not more
23	than 10 years after the date on which
24	the agency completes the assessment,

under which the agency shall conduct

25

1	another assessment of the rule in ac-
2	cordance with subparagraph (A); and
3	"(II) if the assessment conducted
4	under subclause (I) does not result in
5	a repeal of the rule, periodically assess
6	the rule in accordance with subpara-
7	graph (A) to ensure that the rule con-
8	tinues to meet the regulatory objec-
9	tive.
10	"(ii) Exemption.—The Adminis-
11	trator may exempt an agency from con-
12	ducting a subsequent assessment of a rule
13	under clause (i) if the Administrator deter-
14	mines that there is a foreseeable and ap-
15	parent need for the rule beyond the time-
16	frame required under clause (i)(I).
17	"(D) Publication.—Not later than 180
18	days after the date on which an agency com-
19	pletes an assessment of a major rule or a high-
20	impact rule under subparagraph (A), the agen-
21	cy shall publish a notice of availability of the re-
22	sults of the assessment in the Federal Register,
23	including the specific time for any subsequent
24	assessment of the rule under subparagraph
25	(C)(i), if applicable.

1	"(3) OIRA OVERSIGHT.—The Administrator
2	shall—
3	"(A) issue guidance for agencies regarding
4	the development of the framework under para-
5	graph (1) and the conduct of the assessments
6	under paragraph (2)(A);
7	"(B) oversee the timely compliance of
8	agencies with this subsection;
9	"(C) ensure that the results of each assess-
10	ment conducted under paragraph (2)(A) are—
11	"(i) published promptly on a central-
12	ized Federal website; and
13	"(ii) noticed in the Federal Register
14	in accordance with paragraph (2)(D);
15	"(D) ensure that agencies streamline and
16	coordinate the assessment of major rules or
17	high-impact rules with similar or related regu-
18	latory objectives;
19	"(E) exempt an agency from including the
20	framework required under paragraph (1)(B)
21	when publishing a final major rule or a final
22	high-impact rule if the Administrator deter-
23	mines that compliance with paragraph (1)(B) is
24	unnecessary, impracticable, or contrary to the

1	public interest, as described in subsection
2	(g)(3)(A)(i); and
3	"(F) extend the deadline specified by an
4	agency for an assessment of a major rule or a
5	high-impact rule under paragraph (1)(B)(iv) or
6	paragraph (2)(C)(i)(I) for a period of not more
7	than 90 days if the agency justifies why the
8	agency is unable to complete the assessment by
9	that deadline.
10	"(4) Rule of Construction.—Nothing in
11	this subsection shall be construed to affect—
12	"(A) the authority of an agency to assess
13	or modify a major rule or a high-impact rule of
14	the agency earlier than the end of the time-
15	frame specified for the rule under paragraph
16	(1)(B)(iv); or
17	"(B) any other provision of law that re-
18	quires an agency to conduct retrospective re-
19	views of rules issued by the agency.
20	"(5) Applicability.—
21	"(A) In general.—This subsection shall
22	not apply to—
23	"(i) a major rule or a high-impact
24	rule of an agency—

1	"(I) that the Administrator re-
2	viewed before the date of enactment of
3	this subsection;
4	"(II) for which the agency is re-
5	quired to conduct a retrospective re-
6	view under any other provision of law
7	that meets or exceeds the require-
8	ments of this subsection, as deter-
9	mined by the Administrator; or
10	"(III) for which the authorizing
11	statute is subject to periodic reauthor-
12	ization by Congress not less fre-
13	quently than once every 10 years;
14	"(ii) guidance;
15	"(iii) routine and administrative rules;
16	or
17	"(iv) a rule that is reviewed under
18	section 2222 of the Economic Growth and
19	Regulatory Paperwork Reduction Act of
20	1996 (12 U.S.C. 3311).
21	"(B) Direct and interim final major
22	RULE OR HIGH-IMPACT RULE.—In the case of a
23	major rule or a high-impact rule of an agency
24	for which the agency is not required to issue a
25	notice of proposed rulemaking in response to an

1	emergency or a statutorily imposed deadline,
2	the agency shall publish the framework required
3	under paragraph (1)(B) in the Federal Register
4	not later than 180 days after the date on which
5	the agency publishes the rule.
6	"(6) Recommendations to congress.—If,
7	under an assessment conducted under paragraph
8	(2), an agency determines that a major rule or a
9	high-impact rule should be modified or repealed, the
10	agency may submit to Congress recommendations
11	for legislation to amend applicable provisions of law
12	if the agency is prohibited from modifying or repeal-
13	ing the rule under another provision of law.
14	"(7) Judicial review.—
15	"(A) In general.—Judicial review of
16	agency compliance with this subsection is lim-
17	ited to whether an agency—
18	"(i) published the framework for as-
19	sessment of a major rule or a high-impact
20	rule in accordance with paragraph (1); or
21	"(ii) completed and published the re-
22	quired assessment of a major rule or a
23	high-impact rule in accordance with sub-
24	paragraphs (A) and (D) of paragraph (2).

"(B) REMEDY AVAILABLE.—In granting relief in an action brought under subparagraph (A), a court may only issue an order remanding the major rule or the high-impact rule, as applicable, to the agency to comply with paragraph (1) or subparagraph (A) or (D) of paragraph (2), as applicable.

"(C) EFFECTIVE DATE OF MAJOR OR HIGH-IMPACT RULE.—If, in an action brought under subparagraph (A)(i), a court determines that the agency did not comply, the major rule or the high-impact rule, as applicable, shall take effect notwithstanding any order issued by the court.

"(m) Rule of Construction.—Nothing in this section shall be construed to limit the scope of the authority of the Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs under subchapter I of chapter 35 of title 44, section 515 of the Treasury and General Government Appropriations Act, 20 2001 (Public Law 106–554; 114 Stat. 2763A–154), chapter 8 of this title, or any other law or Executive Order.".

## 22 SEC. 4. SCOPE OF REVIEW.

23 Section 706 of title 5, United States Code, is amend-24 ed—

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1	(1) in the first sentence of the matter preceding
2	paragraph (1), by striking "To the extent nec-
3	essary" and inserting the following:
4	"(a) In General.—To the extent necessary"; and
5	(2) in subsection (a), as so designated—
6	(A) in paragraph (1), by striking "and" at
7	the end;
8	(B) in paragraph (2)—
9	(i) in the matter preceding subpara-
10	graph (A), by inserting ", or, when appro-
11	priate, remand a matter to an agency with-
12	out setting aside," after "set aside"; and
13	(ii) in subparagraph (F), by striking
14	the period at the end and inserting ";
15	and"; and
16	(C) by striking the flush text following
17	paragraph (2)(F) and inserting the following:
18	"(3) with respect to the review of a high-impact
19	rule, as defined in section 551 of this title, deter-
20	mine whether the factual findings of the agency
21	issuing the rule are supported by substantial evi-
22	dence.
23	"(b) Review of Entire Record; Prejudicial
24	Error.—In making a determination under subsection (a),
25	the court shall review the whole record or those parts of

- 1 the record cited by a party, and due account shall be taken
- 2 of the rule of prejudicial error.
- 3 "(c) Preclusion of Review.—
- 4 "(1) In general.—Any action or inaction of
- 5 the Administrator under subchapter II of chapter 5,
- 6 except sections 552 and 552a, shall not be subject
- 7 to judicial review.
- 8 "(2) Rule of construction.—The preclusion
- 9 of judicial review under this subsection shall not be
- 10 construed or used to construe any other provision of
- law to provide any cause of action against the Ad-
- ministrator, except as explicitly provided by law.
- 13 "(d) Review of Certain Guidance.—Agency guid-
- 14 ance that does not interpret a statute or rule may be re-
- 15 viewed only under subsection (a)(2)(D).
- 16 "(e) Agency Interpretation of Rules.—The
- 17 weight that a reviewing court gives an interpretation by
- 18 an agency of a rule of that agency shall depend on the
- 19 thoroughness evident in the consideration of the rule by
- 20 the agency, the validity of the reasoning of the agency,
- 21 and the consistency of the interpretation with earlier and
- 22 later pronouncements.".
- 23 SEC. 5. ADDED DEFINITIONS.
- Section 701(b) of title 5, United States Code, is
- 25 amended—

1	(1) in paragraph (1)(H), by striking "and" at
2	the end;
3	(2) in paragraph (2)—
4	(A) by inserting "'guidance'," after "'re-
5	lief',''; and
6	(B) by striking the period at the end and
7	inserting "; and; and
8	(3) by adding at the end the following:
9	"(3) 'substantial evidence' means such relevant
10	evidence as a reasonable mind might accept as ade-
11	quate to support a conclusion in light of the record
12	considered as a whole.".
13	SEC. 6. APPLICATION.
14	The amendments made by this Act to sections 553,
15	701(b), and 706 of title 5, United States Code, shall not
16	apply to any rulemaking, as defined in section 551 of title
17	5, United States Code, as amended by section 2 of this
18	Act, that is pending or completed as of the date of enact-
19	ment of this Act.
20	SEC. 7. RULE OF CONSTRUCTION WITH RESPECT TO COPY-
21	RIGHTS.
22	Nothing in this Act, or in the amendments made by
23	this Act, may be construed as altering, modifying, or
24	abridging an exclusive right granted under title 17, United
25	States Code.

## 1 SEC. 8. TECHNICAL AND CONFORMING AMENDMENTS.

- 2 (a) Alaska National Interest Lands Conserva-
- 3 TION ACT.—Section 1002(g)(2) of the Alaska National In-
- 4 terest Lands Conservation Act (16 U.S.C. 3142(g)(2)) is
- 5 amended, in the third sentence, by striking "section
- 6 706(2)(E)" and inserting "section 706(a)(2)(E)".
- 7 (b) Antarctic Marine Living Resources Con-
- 8 VENTION ACT OF 1984.—Section 308(c) of the Antarctic
- 9 Marine Living Resources Convention Act of 1984 (16
- 10 U.S.C. 2437(c)) is amended, in the third sentence, by
- 11 striking "section 706(2)(E)" and inserting "section
- 12 706(a)(2)(E)".
- 13 (c) Congressional Accountability Act of
- 14 1995.—Section 409 of the Congressional Accountability
- 15 Act of 1995 (2 U.S.C. 1409) is amended, in the first sen-
- 16 tence—
- 17 (1) by striking "section 706(2)" and inserting
- 18 "section 706(a)(2)"; and
- 19 (2) by striking "section 706(2)(B)" and insert-
- ing "section 706(a)(2)(B)".
- 21 (d) Consumer Product Safety Act.—Section 9(i)
- 22 of the Consumer Product Safety Act (15 U.S.C. 2058(i))
- 23 is amended, in the first sentence, by striking "section
- 24 553(e)" and inserting "section 553(i)".
- 25 (e) Deep Seabed Hard Mineral Resources
- 26 Act.—Section 302(b) of the Deep Seabed Hard Mineral

- 1 Resources Act (30 U.S.C. 1462(b)) is amended, in the
- 2 third sentence, by striking "section 706(2)(E)" and in-
- 3 serting "section 706(a)(2)(E)".
- 4 (f) Defense Production Act of 1950.—Section
- 5 709(b)(1) of the Defense Production Act of 1950 (50
- 6 U.S.C. 4559(b)(1)) is amended by striking "for not less
- 7 than 30 days, consistent with the requirements of section
- 8 553(b)" and inserting "in a manner consistent with the
- 9 requirements of section 553(c)".
- 10 (g) Endangered Species Act of 1973.—Section
- 11 4(b)(3) of the Endangered Species Act of 1973 (16 U.S.C.
- 12 1533(b)(3)) is amended—
- 13 (1) in subparagraph (A), in the first sentence,
- by striking "section 553(e)" and inserting "section
- 15 553(i)"; and
- 16 (2) in subparagraph (D)(i), in the first sen-
- tence, by striking "section 553(e)" and inserting
- 18 "section 553(i)".
- 19 (h) Expedited Funds Availability Act.—Section
- 20 609(a) of the Expedited Funds Availability Act (12 U.S.C.
- 21 4008(a)) is amended, in the matter preceding paragraph
- 22 (1), by striking "section 553(c)" and inserting "section
- 23 553".
- 24 (i) Fastener Quality Act.—Section 6(b)(3) of the
- 25 Fastener Quality Act (15 U.S.C. 5408(b)(3)) is amended,

- 1 in the second sentence, by striking "section 706(2)" and
- 2 inserting "section 706(a)(2)".
- 3 (j) Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act.—
- 4 Section 912(b) of the Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic
- 5 Act (21 U.S.C. 387l(b)) is amended, in the second sen-
- 6 tence, by striking "section 706(2)(A)" and inserting "sec-
- 7 tion 706(a)(2)(A)".
- 8 (k) Federal Hazardous Substances Act.—Sec-
- 9 tion 3 of the Federal Hazardous Substances Act (15
- 10 U.S.C. 1262) is amended—
- 11 (1) in subsection (e)(1), in the first sentence, by
- striking "(other than clause (B) of the last sentence
- of subsection (b) of such section) of title 5 of the
- 14 United States Code" and inserting "of title 5,
- United States Code, other than subsection (g)(3) of
- such section,"; and
- 17 (2) in subsection (j), in the first sentence, by
- striking "section 553(e)" and inserting "section
- 19 553(i)".
- 20 (l) Federal Trade Commission Act.—Section
- 21 18(e) of the Federal Trade Commission Act (15 U.S.C.
- 22 57a(e)) is amended—
- (1) in paragraph (3), in the second sentence of
- 24 the matter preceding subparagraph (A), by striking

- "section 706(2)" and inserting "section 706(a)(2)";
- 2 and
- 3 (2) in paragraph (5)(C), in the second sentence,
- 4 by striking "Section 706(2)(E)" and inserting "Sec-
- 5 tion 706(a)(2)(E)".
- 6 (m) FLAMMABLE FABRICS ACT.—The Flammable
- 7 Fabrics Act (15 U.S.C. 1191 et seq.) is amended—
- 8 (1) in section 4(k) (15 U.S.C. 1193(k)), in the
- 9 first sentence, by striking "section 553(e)" and in-
- serting "section 553(i)"; and
- 11 (2) in section 16(e)(2) (15 U.S.C. 1203(e)(2)),
- by striking "section 553(b)" and inserting "section
- 13 553(c)".
- 14 (n) General Education Provisions Act.—Sec-
- 15 tion 411 of the General Education Provisions Act (20
- 16 U.S.C. 1221e-4) is amended, in the second sentence, by
- 17 striking "Notwithstanding the exception provided under
- 18 section 553(b) of title 5, such" and inserting "Such".
- 19 (o) High Seas Fishing Compliance Act of
- 20 1995.—Section 108(d) of the High Seas Fishing Compli-
- 21 ance Act of 1995 (16 U.S.C. 5507(d)) is amended, in the
- 22 third sentence, by striking "section 706(2)" and inserting
- 23 "section 706(a)(2)".

- 1 (p) Housing and Community Development Act
- 2 OF 1992.—The Housing and Community Development
- 3 Act of 1992 (12 U.S.C. 4501 et seq.) is amended—
- 4 (1) in section 643(b)(3) (42 U.S.C.
- 5 13603(b)(3)), in the first sentence, by striking
- 6 "(notwithstanding subsections (a)(2), (b)(B), and
- 7 (d)(3) of such section)" and inserting "(notwith-
- 8 standing subsections (a)(2), (g)(3), and (h)(2) of
- 9 such section)"; and
- 10 (2) in section 685 (42 U.S.C. 13643), in the
- second sentence, by striking "(notwithstanding sub-
- sections (a)(2), (b)(B), and (d)(3) of such section)"
- and inserting "(notwithstanding subsections (a)(2),
- 14 (g)(3), and (h)(2) of such section)".
- 15 (q) International Banking Act of 1978.—Sec-
- 16 tion 7(f)(2) of the International Banking Act of 1978 (12
- 17 U.S.C. 3105(f)(2)) is amended by striking "paragraph"
- 18 (2)(F)" and inserting "subsection (a)(2)(F)".
- 19 (r) Magnuson-Stevens Fishery Conservation
- 20 AND MANAGEMENT ACT.—Section 308(b) of the Magnu-
- 21 son-Stevens Fishery Conservation and Management Act
- 22 (16 U.S.C. 1858(b)) is amended, in the third sentence,
- 23 by striking "section 706(2)" and inserting "section
- 24 706(a)(2)".

1 (s) Marine Mammal Protection Act of 1972.— 2 Section 109 of the Marine Mammal Protection Act of 1972 (16 U.S.C. 1379) is amended— 3 4 (1) in subsection (c)(4), in the first sentence, by 5 striking "section 706(2) (A) through (E) of Title" 6 and inserting "subparagraphs (A) through (E) of 7 section 706(a)(2) of title"; and 8 (2) in subsection (d)(2), in the second sen-9 tence— (A) by striking "Title" and inserting 10 11 "title"; and 12 (B) by striking "subsection (d) of such sec-13 tion 553" and inserting "subsection (h) of such 14 section 553". 15 (t) MCKINNEY-VENTO Homeless ASSISTANCE Act.—Section 433 of the McKinney-Vento Homeless As-16 17 sistance Act (42 U.S.C. 11387) is amended, in the second sentence, by striking "(notwithstanding subsections 18 19 (a)(2), (b)(B), and (d)(3) of such section)" and inserting 20 "(notwithstanding subsections (a)(2), (g)(3), and (h)(2) of 21 such section)". 22 (u) MIGRANT AND SEASONAL AGRICULTURAL WORK-23 ER PROTECTION ACT.—The Migrant and Seasonal Agricultural Worker Protection Act (29 U.S.C. 1801 et seq.) is amended—

```
1
             (1) in section 103(c) (29 U.S.C. 1813(c)), in
 2
        the third sentence, by striking "section 706(2)(E)"
        and inserting "section 706(a)(2)(E)"; and
 3
 4
             (2) in section 503(c) (29 U.S.C. 1853(c)), in
 5
        the third sentence, by striking "section 706(2)(E)"
 6
        and inserting "section 706(a)(2)(E)".
 7
        (v) Milwaukee Railroad Restructuring Act.—
 8
    The Milwaukee Railroad Restructuring Act (45 U.S.C.
 9
   901 et seq.) is amended—
10
             (1) in section 5(b)(2) (45 U.S.C. 904(b)(2)), in
11
        the second sentence, by striking "sections 706(2)(A),
12
        706(2)(B), 706(2)(C), and 706(2)(D) of title 5 of
        the United States Code" and inserting "subpara-
13
14
        graphs (A), (B), (C), and (D) of section 706(a)(2)
15
        of title 5, United States Code"; and
16
             (2) in section 17(b)(2) (45 U.S.C. 915(b)(2)),
17
            the second sentence, by striking "sections
18
        706(2)(A), 706(2)(B), 706(2)(C), and 706(2)(D) of
19
        title 5 of the United States Code" and inserting
        "subparagraphs (A), (B), (C), and (D) of section
20
21
        706(a)(2) of title 5, United States Code".
22
        (w) Native American Programs Act of 1974.—
23
    Section 814 of the Native American Programs Act of 1974
    (42 U.S.C. 2992b–1) is amended—
25
             (1) in subsection (b)—
```

1	(A) in paragraph (1), in the matter pre-
2	ceding subparagraph (A), by striking "Subpara-
3	graph (A) of the last sentence of section 553(b)
4	of title 5, United States Code, shall not apply
5	with respect to any interpretative rule or gen-
6	eral statement of policy" and inserting "Section
7	553(c) of title 5, United States Code, shall
8	apply with respect to guidance";
9	(B) in paragraph (2)—
10	(i) in the matter preceding subpara-
11	graph (A), by striking "Subparagraph (B)
12	of the last sentence of section 553(b)" and
13	inserting "Section 553(g)(3)"; and
14	(ii) by striking "an interpretative rule
15	or a general statement of policy" and in-
16	serting "guidance"; and
17	(C) in paragraph (3), in the matter pre-
18	ceding subparagraph (A)—
19	(i) by striking "The first 2 sentences
20	of section 553(b)" and inserting "Section
21	553(e)"; and
22	(ii) by striking "an interpretative rule,
23	a general statement of policy," and insert-
24	ing "guidance";
25	(2) in subsection (c)—

1	(A) in the matter preceding paragraph
2	(1)—
3	(i) by striking "section 553(d)" and
4	inserting "section 553(h)"; and
5	(ii) by striking "an interpretative
6	rule) or general statement of policy" and
7	inserting "guidance"; and
8	(B) in the flush text following paragraph
9	(2), by striking "the first 2 sentences of section
10	553(b)" and inserting "section 553(c)";
11	(3) in subsection (d), by striking "an interpre-
12	tative rule) and each general statement of policy"
13	and inserting "guidance";
14	(4) in subsection (e)—
15	(A) by striking "any interpretative rule) or
16	a general statement of policy" and inserting
17	"guidance"; and
18	(B) by striking "or such general statement
19	of policy";
20	(5) in subsection (f)—
21	(A) by striking "an interpretative rule) or
22	a general statement of policy" and inserting
23	"guidance"; and
24	(B) by striking "or such general statement
25	of policy'; and

- 1 (6) by adding at the end the following:
- 2 "(g) In this section, the term 'guidance' has the
- 3 meaning given the term in section 551 of title 5, United
- 4 States Code.".
- 5 (x) Natural Gas Policy Act of 1978.—Section
- 6 502(b) of the Natural Gas Policy Act of 1978 (15 U.S.C.
- 7 3412(b)) is amended, in the third sentence, by striking
- 8 "section 553(d)(3)" and inserting "section 553(h)(2)".
- 9 (y) Noise Control Act of 1972.—Section 6(c)(2)
- 10 of the Noise Control Act of 1972 (42 U.S.C. 4905(c)(2))
- 11 is amended by striking "the first sentence of section
- 12 553(c)" and inserting "section 553(c)(4)".
- 13 (z) Northeast Rail Service Act of 1981.—Sec-
- 14 tion 1152(c) of the Northeast Rail Service Act of 1981
- 15 (45 U.S.C. 1105(c)) is amended by striking "paragraphs
- 16 (2) (A), (B), (C), and (D) of section 706, title 5" and
- 17 inserting "subparagraphs (A) through (D) of section
- 18 706(a)(2) of title 5".
- 19 (aa) Northern Pacific Halibut Act of 1982.—
- 20 Section 8(b) of the Northern Pacific Halibut Act of 1982
- 21 (16 U.S.C. 773f(b)) is amended, in the third sentence, by
- 22 striking "section 706(2)" and inserting "section
- 23 706(a)(2)".

1	(bb) Poison Prevention Packaging Act of
2	1970.—The Poison Prevention Packaging Act of 1970 (15
3	U.S.C. 1471 et seq.) is amended—
4	(1) in section 5 (15 U.S.C. 1474)—
5	(A) in subsection (a), in the first sentence
6	by striking "(other than paragraph (3)(B) of
7	the last sentence of subsection (b) of such sec-
8	tion) of title 5 of the United States Code" and
9	inserting "of title 5, United States Code, other
10	than subsection (g)(3) of such section,"; and
11	(B) in subsection (b)—
12	(i) by striking "of the United States
13	Code" each place that term appears and
14	inserting ", United States Code"; and
15	(ii) in paragraph (3), in the first sen-
16	tence, by striking "paragraph (2) of sec-
17	tion 706" and inserting "section
18	706(a)(2)"; and
19	(2) in section $7(c)(2)$ (15 U.S.C. $1476(c)(2)$ )
20	by striking "section 553(b)" and inserting "section
21	553(e)".
22	(cc) Poultry Products Inspection Act.—Section
23	14(c) of the Poultry Products Inspection Act (21 U.S.C
24	463(c)) is amended by striking "section 553(c) of title 5

- 1 United States Code" and inserting "section 553(c)(4) of
- 2 title 5, United States Code,".
- 3 (dd) Public Health Service Act.—Section
- 4 2723(b)(2)(E)(iii) of the Public Health Service Act (42
- 5 U.S.C. 300gg-22(b)(2)(E)(iii)) is amended by striking
- 6 "section 706(2)(E)" and inserting "section
- 7 706(a)(2)(E)".
- 8 (ee) REGIONAL RAIL REORGANIZATION ACT OF
- 9 1973.—Section 216(c)(3) of the Regional Rail Reorga-
- 10 nization Act of 1973 (45 U.S.C. 726(c)(3)) is amended,
- 11 in the fourth sentence, by striking "section 706(2)" and
- 12 inserting "section 706(a)(2)".
- 13 (ff) Social Security Act.—The Social Security Act
- 14 (42 U.S.C. 301 et seq.) is amended—
- 15 (1) in section 221(j) (42 U.S.C. 421(j)), in the
- 16 flush text following paragraph (3), by striking "in
- accordance with section 553(b)(A) of title 5, United
- 18 States Code" and all that follows through "and
- statements" and inserting "in accordance with sec-
- tion 553(g)(2) of title 5, United States Code, of
- 21 guidance or rules of agency organization, procedure,
- or practice relating to consultative examinations if
- such guidance and rules"; and

```
1
             (2)
                        section
                                 1871(b)(2)
                                               (42)
                                                     U.S.C.
                   in
 2
        1395hh(b)(2)), by striking subparagraph (C) and in-
 3
        serting the following:
                  "(C) subsection (c) of section 553 of title
 4
 5
             5, United States Code, does not apply pursuant
 6
             to subsection (g)(3) of such section.".
 7
        (gg) South Pacific Tuna Act of 1988.—Section
 8
    8(b) of the South Pacific Tuna Act of 1988 (16 U.S.C.
 9
    973f(b)) is amended, in the third sentence, by striking
    "section 706(2)" and inserting "section 706(a)(2)".
10
11
        (hh) Tariff Act of 1930.—Section 777(f)(5) of the
12
    Tariff Act of 1930 (19 U.S.C. 1677f(f)(5)) is amended,
    in the third sentence, by striking "section 706(2)" and
    inserting "section 706(a)(2)".
14
15
        (ii) TITLE 5, UNITED STATES CODE.—Title 5,
    United States Code, is amended—
16
17
             (1) in section 556(d), in the sixth sentence, by
18
        striking "rule making" and inserting "rulemaking";
             (2) in section 557(b), in the fourth sentence of
19
20
        the matter preceding paragraph (1), by striking
        "rule making" and inserting "rulemaking";
21
             (3) in section 562(11), by striking "means 'rule
22
23
        making' as that term is defined in section 551(5)"
24
        and inserting "has the meaning given the term in
25
        section 551";
```

- 1 (4) in section 601(2), by striking "section"
- 2 553(b)" and inserting "section 553(c)";
- 3 (5) in section 1103(b)(1), by striking "section"
- 4 553(b)(1), (2), and (3)" and inserting "section
- 5 553(c)"; and
- 6 (6) in section 1105, by striking "subsections
- 7 (b), (c), and (d)" and inserting "subsections (b)
- 8 through (h) and (j)".
- 9 (jj) Title 11, United States Code.—Section
- 10 1172(b) of title 11, United States Code, is amended, in
- 11 the second sentence, by striking "sections 706(2)(A),
- 12 706(2)(B), 706(2)(C), and 706(2)(D) of title 5" and in-
- 13 serting "subparagraphs (A), (B), (C), and (D) of section
- 14 706(a)(2) of title 5".
- 15 (kk) Title 14, United States Code.—Section
- 16 2507(b)(2)(A) of title 14, United States Code, is amended
- 17 by striking "section 706(1)" and inserting "section
- 18 706(a)(1)".
- 19 (II) TITLE 28, UNITED STATES CODE.—Section 3902
- 20 of title 28, United States Code, is amended, in the first
- 21 sentence, by striking "section 706(2)" and inserting "sec-
- 22 tion 706(a)(2)".
- 23 (mm) TITLE 41, UNITED STATES CODE.—Section
- 24 8503(a)(2) of title 41, United States Code, is amended

```
1 by striking "section 553(b) to (e)" and inserting "section
 2
   553".
 3
        (nn) TITLE 46, UNITED STATES CODE.—Title 46,
   United States Code, is amended—
 5
             (1) in section 14104(b), in the second sentence,
 6
        by striking "shall be considered to be an interpretive
 7
        regulation for purposes of section 553 of title 5" and
 8
        inserting "shall be subject to section 553 of title 5";
 9
        and
10
             (2) in section 70105(c)(3)(B), in the second
11
        sentence, by striking "section 706(2)(E)" and in-
12
        serting "section 706(a)(2)(E)".
13
        (00) TOXIC SUBSTANCES CONTROL ACT.—Section
14
   19(c)(1)(B) of the Toxic Substances Control Act (15)
15
   U.S.C. 2618(c)(1)(B)) is amended—
16
             (1) in clause (i)—
17
                 (A) in subclause (I), by striking "para-
                                     inserting "subsection
18
                   (2)(E)"
                               and
             graph
19
             (a)(2)(E)"; and
20
                  (B) in subclause (II), by striking "para-
21
             graph (2)(E)"
                               and
                                     inserting
                                                "subsection
22
             (a)(2)(E)"; and
             (2) in clause (ii), by striking "section 553(c)"
23
        and inserting "section 553(f)(2)".
24
```

- 1 (pp) Unfunded Mandates Reform Act of
- 2 1995.—Section 401(a)(2)(A) of the Unfunded Mandates
- 3 Reform Act of 1995 (2 U.S.C. 1571(a)(2)(A)) is amended
- 4 by striking "section 706(1)" and inserting "section
- 5 706(a)(1)".
- 6 (qq) United States Warehouse Act.—Section
- 7 13(d)(2) of the United States Warehouse Act (7 U.S.C.
- 8 252(d)(2)) is amended by striking "section 706(2)" and
- 9 inserting "section 706(a)(2)".

 $\bigcirc$