

that provides many different health resources to women across the country. I, myself, used Planned Parenthood when planning my family. Planned Parenthood also offers vulnerable communities services they wouldn't otherwise have access to, including critical preventive services like breast and cervical cancer screenings, contraception, and sex education. Simply put, blocking this grant funding endangers women's health across the country. There is no reason we should restrict access to Federal grant money simply to score political points for the MAGA base while limiting reproductive healthcare options.

Mr. Speaker, I ask unanimous consent to insert the text of my amendment into the RECORD, along with any extraneous material, immediately prior to the vote on the previous question.

The SPEAKER pro tempore. Is there objection to the request of the gentleman from Pennsylvania?

There was no objection.

Ms. SCANLON. Mr. Speaker, I reserve the balance of my time.

Mr. BURGESS. Mr. Speaker, I yield myself 1 minute. If anyone is just tuning in, the bill we have before us today is a bill to fund the Federal agencies of Department of Health and Human Services, Department of Labor, and Department of Education. It is not to provide public funding to Planned Parenthood. That funding should come from someplace else, but not the pockets of the American taxpayers.

Mr. Speaker, I reserve the balance of my time.

Ms. SCANLON. Mr. Speaker, I yield myself such time as I may consume.

Mr. Speaker, as I said before, this is a terrible bill. I remind all my colleagues that this is kids' futures that we are talking about. It is the jobs that support American families. It is the health and safety of our loved ones.

If the House's MAGA Republicans had their way, our workers, students, children, women, and families would all suffer if the cuts in this bill were implemented. Our public schools, the centerpieces of our communities and our democracy, would be decimated. Hardworking people would be underwater, unable to find good-paying jobs to keep themselves and their families afloat. Devastating diseases would go uncured and unchecked, and women would be denied the right to make their own free choices about their own healthcare.

America and the people who live here are worth investing in so much more than this, and I won't accept the bleak and nihilistic picture that House Republicans are trying to paint. Our country's future can and should be brighter. It is what our constituents and our children deserve.

Mr. Speaker, I urge my colleagues to oppose the previous question and the rule, and I yield back the balance of my time.

Mr. BURGESS. Mr. Speaker, I yield myself the balance of my time to close.

Again, I remind colleagues on my side of the aisle that if they do not want a December omnibus, a giant Christmas tree with all sorts of things hung upon it like they saw last year, then they should understand that we need to pass individual appropriations bills.

Colleagues on my side of the aisle should carefully look at this bill and vote in favor of passing the rule and the underlying bill.

There are over 60 programs that are currently being funded that are not authorized. Well, that is on us as authorizers in the authorizing committees, to be sure. However, at the same time, we cannot continue to write checks, to send money to programs that no one has bothered to authorize. If these are important programs that need to continue, then we on the authorizing committees should do the work, dig into the details of the program, bring in the witnesses, take the testimony, and do the appropriate authorization. The fact that that has not happened in so many programs for so long indicates how broken the process is.

□ 0945

We need to reverse that, reverse that curse, reverse that inexorable spending that results if you just simply fund the government at a 15 percent greater level than you did last year before going back to basics and seeing if the program was even necessary.

Mr. Speaker, this legislation has many conservative policies that deliver results to the American people. H.R. 5894, the underlying appropriations bill, works to reverse the harmful effects of controversial executive orders and the woke politics that have really damaged our country.

Republicans seek to protect life, promote American values in the classroom, prioritize safe medical research, and combat the opioid epidemic, all while reining in unnecessary spending and promoting oversight and accountability. That is why I support the rule.

Mr. Speaker, I urge my colleagues to support the rule. I support the underlying bill and urge my colleagues to support the underlying bill.

The material previously referred to by Ms. SCANLON is as follows:

AN AMENDMENT TO H. RES. 864 OFFERED BY
MS. SCANLON OF PENNSYLVANIA

At the end of the resolution, add the following:

SEC. 6. Notwithstanding any other provision of this resolution, the amendment specified in section 7 shall be in order as though printed as the last amendment in part B of the report of the Committee on Rules accompanying this resolution if offered by Representatives DELAUNO of Connecticut or a designee. That amendment shall be debatable for 10 minutes equally divided and controlled by the proponent and an opponent.

SEC. 7. The amendment referred to in section 6 is as follows:

“Strike section 239.”

Mr. BURGESS. Mr. Speaker, I yield back the balance of my time, and I move the previous question on the resolution.

The SPEAKER pro tempore. The question is on ordering the previous question.

The question was taken; and the Speaker pro tempore announced that the ayes appeared to have it.

Ms. SCANLON. Mr. Speaker, on that I demand the yeas and nays.

The yeas and nays were ordered.

The SPEAKER pro tempore. Pursuant to clause 8 of rule XX, further proceedings on this question are postponed.

RECESS

The SPEAKER pro tempore. Pursuant to clause 12(a) of rule I, the Chair declares the House in recess subject to the call of the Chair.

Accordingly (at 9 o'clock and 46 minutes a.m.), the House stood in recess.

□ 1030

AFTER RECESS

The recess having expired, the House was called to order by the Speaker pro tempore (Mrs. BICE) at 10 o'clock and 30 minutes a.m. after recess.

ANNOUNCEMENT BY THE SPEAKER PRO TEMPORE

The SPEAKER pro tempore. Proceedings will resume on questions previously postponed. Votes will be taken in the following order:

Ordering the previous question on House Resolution 864; and

Adoption of House Resolution 864, if ordered.

The first electronic vote will be conducted as a 15-minute vote.

Pursuant to clause 9 of rule XX, remaining electronic votes will be conducted as 5-minute votes.

PROVIDING FOR CONSIDERATION OF H.R. 5894, DEPARTMENTS OF LABOR, HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, AND EDUCATION, AND RELATED AGENCIES APPROPRIATIONS ACT, 2024

The SPEAKER pro tempore. Pursuant to clause 8 of rule XX, the unfinished business is the vote on ordering the previous question on the resolution (H. Res. 864) providing for consideration of the bill (H.R. 5894), making appropriations for the Departments of Labor, Health and Human Services, and Education, and related agencies for the fiscal year ending September 30, 2024, and for other purposes, on which the yeas and nays were ordered.

The Clerk read the title of the resolution.

The SPEAKER pro tempore. The question is on ordering the previous question on the resolution.

The vote was taken by electronic device, and there were—yeas 217, nays 208, not voting 8, as follows:

[Roll No. 646]

YEAS—217

Aderholt	Gallagher	Miller (WV)
Alford	Garbarino	Miller-Meeks
Allen	Garcia, Mike	Mills
Amodei	Gimenez	Molinaro
Armstrong	Gonzales, Tony	Moolenaar
Arrington	Good (VA)	Moore (AL)
Babin	Gooden (TX)	Moore (UT)
Bacon	Gosar	Moran
Baird	Granger	Murphy
Balderson	Graves (LA)	Nehls
Banks	Graves (MO)	Newhouse
Barr	Green (TN)	Norman
Bean (FL)	Greene (GA)	Nunn (IA)
Bentz	Griffith	Obernolte
Bergman	Grothman	Ogles
Bice	Guest	Owens
Biggs	Guthrie	Palmer
Bilirakis	Hageman	Pence
Bishop (NC)	Harris	Perry
Boebert	Harshbarger	Pfuger
Bost	Hern	Posey
Brecheen	Higgins (LA)	Reschenthaler
Buchanan	Hill	Rodgers (WA)
Buck	Hinson	Rogers (AL)
Bucshon	Houchin	Rogers (KY)
Burchett	Hudson	Rose
Burgess	Huizenga	Rosendale
Burlison	Hunt	Rouzer
Calvert	Issa	Roy
Cammack	Jackson (TX)	Rutherford
Carey	James	Santos
Carl	Johnson (OH)	Scalise
Carter (GA)	Johnson (SD)	Schweikert
Carter (TX)	Jordan	Self
Chavez-DeRemer	Joyce (OH)	Sessions
Ciscomani	Joyce (PA)	Simpson
Cline	Kean (NJ)	Smith (MO)
Cloud	Kelly (MS)	Smith (NE)
Clyde	Kelly (PA)	Smith (NJ)
Cole	Kiggans (VA)	Smucker
Collins	Kiley	Spartz
Comer	Kim (CA)	Stauber
Crane	Kustoff	Steel
Crawford	LaHood	Stefanik
Crenshaw	LaLota	Steil
Curtis	LaMalfa	Steube
D'Esposito	Lamborn	Strong
Davidson	Langworthy	Tenney
De La Cruz	Latta	Thompson (PA)
DesJarlais	LaTurner	Tiffany
Diaz-Balart	Lawler	Timmons
Donalds	Lee (FL)	Turner
Duarte	Lesko	Valadao
Duncan	Letlow	Van Drew
Dunn (FL)	Loudermilk	Van Dwyne
Edwards	Lucas	Van Orden
Ellzey	Luetkemeyer	Wagner
Emmer	Luna	Walberg
Estes	Luttrell	Waltz
Fallon	Mace	Webster (FL)
Feenstra	Malliotakis	Westerman
Ferguson	Mann	Williams (NY)
Finstad	Massie	Williams (TX)
Fischbach	Mast	Wilson (SC)
Fitzgerald	McCarthy	Wittman
Fitzpatrick	McCaul	Womack
Fleischmann	McClain	Yakym
Flood	McClintock	Zinke
Foxx	McCormick	
Franklin, Scott	McHenry	
Fry	Meuser	
Fulcher	Miller (IL)	
Gaetz	Miller (OH)	

NAYS—208

Adams	Carbajal	Courtney
Aguilar	Cárdenas	Craig
Allred	Carson	Crockett
Amo	Carter (LA)	Crow
Auchincloss	Cartwright	Cuellar
Balint	Casar	Davids (KS)
Barragán	Case	Davis (IL)
Beatty	Casten	Davis (NC)
Bera	Castor (FL)	Dean (PA)
Beyer	Castro (TX)	DeGette
Bishop (GA)	Cherfilus	DeLauro
Blumenauer	McCormick	DelBene
Blunt Rochester	Chu	Deluzio
Bonamici	Clark (MA)	DeSaulnier
Bowman	Clarke (NY)	Dingell
Boyle (PA)	Cleaver	Doggett
Brown	Clyburn	Escobar
Brownley	Cohen	Eshoo
Budzinski	Connolly	Españillat
Bush	Correa	Evans
Caraveo	Costa	Fletcher

Foster	Lofgren	Sarbanes
Foushee	Lynch	Scanlon
Frankel, Lois	Magaziner	Schakowsky
Frost	Manning	Schiff
Gallego	Matsui	Schneider
Garamendi	McBath	Scholten
Garcia (IL)	McClellan	Schrier
Garcia (TX)	McCollum	Scott (VA)
Garcia, Robert	McGarvey	Scott, David
Golden (ME)	McGovern	Sewell
Goldman (NY)	Meeks	Sherman
Gomez	Menendez	Sherrill
Gonzalez,	Meng	Slotkin
Vicente	Mfume	Smith (WA)
Gottheimer	Moore (WI)	Sorensen
Green, Al (TX)	Morelle	Soto
Grijalva	Moskowitz	Spanberger
Harder (CA)	Moulton	Stansbury
Hayes	Mryan	Stanton
Higgins (NY)	Nadler	Stevens
Himes	Napolitano	Strickland
Horsford	Neal	Swalwell
Hoyer	Neguse	Sykes
Hoyle (OR)	Nickel	Takano
Huffman	Norcross	Thanedar
Ivey	Ocasio-Cortez	Thompson (CA)
Jackson (IL)	Omar	Thompson (MS)
Jackson (NC)	Pallone	Titus
Jacobs	Panetta	Tlaib
Jayapal	Pappas	Tokuda
Jeffries	Pascarell	Tonko
Johnson (GA)	Payne	Torres (CA)
Kamlager-Dove	Peltola	Torres (NY)
Keating	Perez	Trahan
Kelly (IL)	Peters	Trone
Khanna	Petterson	Underwood
Kildee	Phillips	Vargas
Kilmer	Pingree	Vasquez
Kim (NJ)	Pocan	Veasey
Krishnamoorthi	Porter	Velazquez
Kuster	Pressley	Wasserman
Landsman	Quigley	Schultz
Larsen (WA)	Ramirez	Waters
Larson (CT)	Raskin	Watson Coleman
Lee (CA)	Ross	Wexton
Lee (NV)	Ruiz	Wild
Lee (PA)	Ruppersberger	Williams (GA)
Leger Fernandez	Ryan	Wilson (FL)
Levin	Salinas	
Lieu	Sánchez	

NOT VOTING—8

Ezell	Kaptur	Pelosi
Houlihan	Mooney	Salazar
Jackson Lee	Mullin	

□ 1059

Messrs. COURTNEY, PHILLIPS, and LANDSMAN changed their vote from “yea” to “nay.”

So the previous question was ordered. The result of the vote was announced as above recorded.

The SPEAKER pro tempore. The question is on the resolution.

The question was taken; and the Speaker pro tempore announced that the ayes appeared to have it.

RECORDED VOTE

Ms. SCANLON. Madam Speaker, I demand a recorded vote.

A recorded vote was ordered.

The SPEAKER pro tempore. This is a 5-minute vote.

The vote was taken by electronic device, and there were—ayes 217, noes 209, not voting 8, as follows:

[Roll No. 647]

AYES—217

Aderholt	Bentz	Burchett
Alford	Bergman	Burgess
Allen	Bice	Burlison
Amodei	Biggs	Calvert
Armstrong	Bilirakis	Cammack
Babin	Bishop (NC)	Carey
Bacon	Boebert	Carl
Baird	Bost	Carter (GA)
Balderson	Brecheen	Carter (TX)
Banks	Buchanan	Chavez-DeRemer
Barr	Buck	Ciscomani
Bean (FL)	Bucshon	Cline

Cloud	Hudson	Nunn (IA)
Clyde	Huizenga	Obernolte
Cole	Hunt	Ogles
Collins	Issa	Owens
Comer	Jackson (TX)	Palmer
Crane	James	Pence
Crawford	Johnson (LA)	Perry
Crenshaw	Johnson (OH)	Pfuger
Curtis	Johnson (SD)	Posey
D'Esposito	Jordan	Reschenthaler
Davidson	Joyce (OH)	Rodgers (WA)
De La Cruz	Joyce (PA)	Rogers (AL)
DesJarlais	Kean (NJ)	Rogers (KY)
Diaz-Balart	Kelly (MS)	Rose
Donalds	Kelly (PA)	Rosendale
Duarte	Kiggans (VA)	Rouzer
Duncan	Kiley	Roy
Dunn (FL)	Kim (CA)	Rutherford
Edwards	Kustoff	Santos
Ellzey	LaHood	Scalise
Emmer	LaLota	Schweikert
Estes	LaMalfa	Scott, Austin
Fallon	Lamborn	Self
Feenstra	Langworthy	Sessions
Ferguson	Latta	Simpson
Finstad	LaTurner	Smith (MO)
Fischbach	Lawler	Smith (NE)
Fitzgerald	Lee (FL)	Smith (NJ)
Fitzpatrick	Lesko	Smucker
Fleischmann	Letlow	Loudermilk
Flood	Loudermilk	Staubert
Foxx	Lucas	Steel
Franklin, Scott	Luetkemeyer	Stefanik
Fry	Luna	Steil
Fulcher	Luttrell	Steube
Gaetz	Mace	Strong
Gallagher	Malliotakis	Tenney
Garbarino	Mann	Thompson (PA)
Garcia, Mike	Massie	Tiffany
Gimenez	Mast	Timmons
Gonzales, Tony	McCarthy	Turner
Good (VA)	McCaul	Valadao
Gooden (TX)	McClain	Van Drew
Gosar	McClintock	Van Dwyne
Granger	McCormick	Van Orden
Graves (LA)	McHenry	Wagner
Graves (MO)	Meuser	Walberg
Green (TN)	Miller (IL)	Waltz
Greene (GA)	Miller (OH)	Webster (FL)
Griffith	Miller (WV)	Westerman
Grothman	Miller-Meeks	Williams (NY)
Guest	Mills	Williams (TX)
Guthrie	Molinaro	Wilson (SC)
Hageman	Moolenaar	Wittman
Harris	Moore (AL)	Womack
Harshbarger	Moore (UT)	Yakym
Hern	Moran	Zinke
Higgins (LA)	Murphy	
Hill	Nehls	
Hinson	Newhouse	
Houchin	Norman	

NOES—209

Adams	Cohen	Gomez
Aguilar	Connolly	Gonzalez,
Allred	Correa	Vicente
Amo	Costa	Gottheimer
Auchincloss	Courtney	Green, Al (TX)
Balint	Craig	Grijalva
Barragán	Crockett	Harder (CA)
Beatty	Crow	Hayes
Bera	Cuellar	Higgins (NY)
Beyer	Davids (KS)	Himes
Bishop (GA)	Davis (IL)	Horsford
Blumenauer	Davis (NC)	Houlihan
Blunt Rochester	Dean (PA)	Hoyer
Bonamici	DeGette	Hoyle (OR)
Bowman	DeLauro	Huffman
Boyle (PA)	DelBene	Ivey
Brown	Deluzio	Jackson (IL)
Brownley	DeSaulnier	Jackson (NC)
Budzinski	Dingell	Jacobs
Bush	Doggett	Jayapal
Caraveo	Escobar	Jeffries
Carbajal	Eshoo	Johnson (GA)
Cárdenas	Españillat	Kamlager-Dove
Carson	Evans	Kaptur
Carter (LA)	Fletcher	Keating
Cartwright	Foster	Kelly (IL)
Casar	Foushee	Khanna
Case	Frankel, Lois	Kildee
Casten	Frost	Kilmer
Castor (FL)	Galleo	Kim (NJ)
Castro (TX)	Garamendi	Krishnamoorthi
Chu	Garcia (IL)	Kuster
Clark (MA)	Garcia (TX)	Landsman
Clarke (NY)	Garcia, Robert	Larsen (WA)
Cleaver	Golden (ME)	Larson (CT)
Clyburn	Goldman (NY)	Lee (CA)

Lee (NV)	Pascarell	Soto
Lee (PA)	Payne	Spanberger
Leger Fernandez	Peltola	Stansbury
Levin	Perez	Stanton
Lieu	Peters	Stevens
Lofgren	Petterson	Strickland
Lynch	Phillips	Swailwell
Magaziner	Pingree	Sykes
Manning	Pocan	Takano
Matsui	Porter	Thanedar
McBath	Pressley	Thompson (CA)
McClellan	Quigley	Thompson (MS)
McCollum	Ramirez	Titus
McGarvey	Raskin	Tlaib
McGovern	Ross	Tokuda
Meeks	Ruiz	Tonko
Menendez	Ruppersberger	Torres (CA)
Meng	Ryan	Torres (NY)
Mfume	Salinas	Trahan
Moore (WI)	Sánchez	Trone
Morelle	Sarbanes	Underwood
Moskowitz	Scanlon	Vargas
Moulton	Schakowsky	Vasquez
Mrvan	Schiff	Veasey
Nadler	Schneider	Velázquez
Napolitano	Scholten	Wasserman
Neal	Schrier	Schultz
Neguse	Scott (VA)	Waters
Nickel	Scott, David	Watson Coleman
Norcross	Sewell	Wexton
Ocasio-Cortez	Sherman	Wild
Omar	Sherrill	Williams (GA)
Pallone	Slotkin	Wilson (FL)
Panetta	Smith (WA)	
Pappas	Sorensen	

NOT VOTING—8

Arrington	Ezell	Mullin
Cherfilus-	Jackson Lee	Pelosi
McCormick	Mooney	Salazar

ANNOUNCEMENT BY THE SPEAKER PRO TEMPORE

The SPEAKER pro tempore (during the vote). There are 2 minutes remaining.

□ 1112

Mr. PHILLIPS changed his vote from “aye” to “no.”

Mr. OGLES changed his vote from “no” to “aye.”

So the resolution was agreed to.

The result of the vote was announced as above recorded.

A motion to reconsider was laid on the table.

DEPARTMENTS OF LABOR, HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, AND EDUCATION, AND RELATED AGENCIES APPROPRIATIONS ACT, 2024

GENERAL LEAVE

Mr. ADERHOLT. Mr. Speaker, I ask unanimous consent that all Members may have 5 legislative days to revise and extend their remarks and to include extraneous material on H.R. 5894, and that I may include tabular material on the same.

The SPEAKER pro tempore. Is there objection to the request of the gentleman from Alabama?

There was no objection.

The SPEAKER pro tempore. Pursuant to House Resolution 864 and rule XVIII, the Chair declares the House in the Committee of the Whole House on the state of the Union for the consideration of the bill, H.R. 5894.

The Chair appoints the gentleman from Tennessee (Mr. DESJARLAIS) to preside over the Committee of the Whole.

□ 1121

IN THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

Accordingly, the House resolved itself into the Committee of the Whole House on the state of the Union for the consideration of the bill (H.R. 5894) making appropriations for the Departments of Labor, Health and Human Services, and Education, and related agencies for the fiscal year ending September 30, 2024, and for other purposes, with Mr. DESJARLAIS in the chair.

The Clerk read the title of the bill.

The CHAIR. Pursuant to the rule, the bill is considered read the first time.

General debate shall be confined to the bill and shall not exceed one hour equally divided and controlled by the chair and ranking minority member of the Committee on Appropriations or their respective designees.

The gentleman from Alabama (Mr. ADERHOLT) and the gentlewoman from Connecticut (Ms. DELAURO) each will control 30 minutes.

The Chair recognizes the gentleman from Alabama (Mr. ADERHOLT).

Mr. ADERHOLT. Mr. Chair, I yield myself such time as I may consume.

Mr. Chair, I rise in support this morning of H.R. 5894, the FY 2024 Labor, Health and Human Services, and Education and related agencies bill.

This is my first year as chair of this very important subcommittee, and I am proud to be able to support programs that touch the lives of literally every American in one form or fashion.

Our Nation remains mired in high inflation, which was only worsened by the massive infusion of government spending, both during and immediately after the COVID pandemic. I have said on numerous occasions that inflation is a tax on every single American. Moreover, it is a tax borne disproportionately by low-income Americans.

We cannot continue to make our constituents pay for our reckless D.C. beltway spending. At some point, we must stop the out-of-control spending spree that we have seen over the past 2 years. This bill that is before the House this morning represents a clear first step toward returning to fiscal responsibility while at the same time ensuring that funding for critical and high-priority functions are maintained.

Yes, the bill before us today reflects the challenges in achieving deficit reduction solely through reductions in discretionary spending. To be honest, a \$60 billion cut to social spending programs in this bill requires scrutiny and priority setting.

Over 50 programs are proposed for reduction and another 60 programs are eliminated. Most of those that are eliminated are unauthorized or they have expired authorizations. Title I grants to States are cut by almost 80 percent, or more than \$14 billion.

While title I grants do support school districts everywhere, including rural districts and the districts back in Alabama that I represent, these funds disproportionately support big city public

schools, those same public schools that failed to educate the most vulnerable children that were entrusted to them by closing their doors for almost 2 years during the pandemic.

It is estimated that over \$20 billion in unspent funding still remains available from those funds that were provided during the pandemic to these schools. Until this funding—over \$21 billion—is drawn down and used responsibly, the Federal Government should not continue to make further investments in these failing schools.

At the same time, the priorities of this bill are biodefense, programs that support rural America, targeted education programs, including those for children with special needs and congressional oversight responsibilities.

The bill also maintains support for Pell grants and language to ensure borrowers can quickly resume payments of their student loans following the recent Supreme Court decision.

Other programs for certain vulnerable populations, such as Americans with disabilities, older Americans, and foster children, are maintained at current levels.

Childcare block grants, which provide vouchers for families to choose childcare settings of their choice, are maintained at \$8 billion.

In response to this administration's executive branch overreach, this bill prohibits funding for programs focused solely on diversity, equity, and inclusion. It eliminates funding for Planned Parenthood and other controversial grantees. It also protects religious freedom and values by stopping the administration's regulations that would require schools to allow biological boys to compete against girls in women's sports programs and prohibiting any Federal funding from going toward enforcing gender identity politics or social, hormonal, or surgical interventions to look like the opposite sex.

The bill prohibits funding for controversial ideologies like critical race theory. These radical views do not belong in public schools. Schools should be teaching our children how to think, not what to think.

The bill maintains the longstanding Hyde amendment to ensure that taxpayer funds are not used for abortion on demand and that no one is forced to participate in an abortion or refer for one under any Federal program.

The bill also makes sure that taxpayer funds are not used to circumvent State laws restricting abortion and also ensures that Federal research funds are not used on human fetal tissue obtained from an elective abortion.

Furthermore, the bill before us also includes provisions preventing this administration from moving forward with job-killing regulations that relate to independent contractors, joint employer status, and federally forced wage rates for agricultural workers. The administration's regulatory agenda is stifling small businesses, which should be an incubator for innovation.